



PROPOSAL TO CLOSE NANTMEL C. IN W. SCHOOL

OBJECTION REPORT

1. Introduction

Powys County Council consulted on a proposal to close Nantmel C. in W. School with effect from the 31st December 2016 during the period 29th January 2016 to the 22nd April 2016.

On the 23rd June 2016, the Council's Cabinet agreed to proceed with the closure of the school, and Statutory Notices were published from the 24th June 2016 to the 22nd July 2016.

2. Objections received

A total of 17 objections were received during the statutory objection period. 2 further objections were received outside of the statutory objection period.

The objections received included responses from the following:

- The Governing Body of Nantmel C. in W. School
- Diocesan Director of Education – Diocese of Swansea and Brecon
- The Bishop of Swansea and Brecon
- County Councillor David O. Evans
- Nantmel Show and Sports
- Busy Bees Playgroup
- Governors at Nantmel C. in W. School
- Members of staff at Nantmel C. in W. School
- Parents of pupils attending Nantmel C. in W. School
- Pupils at Nantmel C. in W. School
- Members of the community

The issues raised in each of the objections received during the statutory objection period are listed in the tables on the following pages, along with the authority's response to these issues.

3. Issues raised in Objections

Issue ref	Points raised	Local authority response
Objection 1		
1.1	Nantmel School is at the heart of a small rural community	The authority acknowledges this comment. However pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are small and are not expected to increase in the next few years. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.' The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, economic and social factors are non-educational issues.
1.2	Nantmel School provides a focus for the community	The authority acknowledges this comment, and accepts that closure of the school would have an impact on the community. However pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are small and are not expected to increase in the next few years. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.' The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, economic and social factors are non-educational issues.
1.3	There are close links between the school and the church	The authority acknowledges this comment, and accepts that closure of the school would have an impact on links with the church. However pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are small and are not expected to increase in the next few years. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.' The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, economic and social factors are non-educational issues.

1.4	Closure of the school would impact on the Church, the Diocese and the community in general	The authority acknowledges this comment, and accepts that closure of the school would have an impact on links with the church, the diocese and the community in general. However pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are small and are not expected to increase in the next few years. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.' The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, economic and social factors are non-educational issues. There would be continued links with the Diocese as the named receiving school is Rhayader C in W school.
1.5	Nantmel School has been in existence for 160 years	The authority acknowledges this comment. However pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are small and are not projected to increase over the next few years. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.'
1.6	Nantmel School provides quality primary education	<p>The authority notes this comment. The quality of education provided at Nantmel C. in W. School is not one of the reasons why closure of the school is being proposed. However, should the school close, the authority is satisfied that education of an equivalent standard would be provided to pupils at the named receiving school.</p> <p>The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the longer term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.</p>
1.7	Nantmel School offers a great opportunity for children living in Nantmel	<p>The authority notes this comment, and acknowledges that any school reorganisation proposal creates a period of uncertainty for pupils. Pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are small and are not projected to increase in the next few years. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.'</p> <p>The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the longer term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.</p>

1.8	The pupils that attend Nantmel School might feel subsumed in a much larger school	<p>The authority acknowledges that some pupils might be happier in a small class / school situation, however all schools are expected to ensure that pupils are happy in their learning environment. Should Nantmel C. in W. School close, the receiving school or any other school pupils might wish to transfer to would be expected to provide full support to pupils to aid their transition and this would be supported by the authority.</p> <p>The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the longer term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.</p>
1.9	The school building is used for an incredible number of activities, as evidenced in the community impact assessment report provided by the governors	The authority has acknowledged in the community impact assessment that the school building is used for a range of activities, and that closure of the school would impact on this. As the building is owned by the church, it would be a matter for the church to determine the future use of the building should the school close. The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, economic and social factors are non-educational issues.
1.10	Children would be unsettled if they had to move to a new school	The authority acknowledges that any school reorganisation proposal creates a period of uncertainty for pupils, however should the school close, the receiving school or any other school pupils might wish to transfer to would provide support to pupils to aid their transition.
Objection 2		
2.1	Outcome of the consultation process demonstrated public support in favour of retaining the school for the community	The issues raised during the consultation period were taken into consideration by Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to this proposal.
2.2	Public opinion appears to have been completely ignored	The issues raised during the consultation period were taken into consideration by Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to this proposal.
2.3	Children are concerned about bigger class sizes, friendships and destruction of their	The authority acknowledges that any school reorganisation proposal creates a period of uncertainty for pupils, however should the school close, the receiving school or

	community during the consultation process	any other school pupils might wish to transfer to would provide support to pupils to aid their transition.
2.4	No-one is listening to the children	The authority does not agree with this statement. Officers from the School Transformation Team met with the School Council of Nantmel C. in W. School during the consultation period in order to hear their views on the proposal. In addition, a number of written consultation responses were received from pupils. The issues raised by pupils were listed separately in the Consultation Report published in respect of this proposal, and were taken into consideration by Cabinet when determining how to proceed.
2.5	The children are in tears over the proposal	The authority acknowledges that any school reorganisation proposal creates a period of uncertainty for pupils, however should the school close, the receiving school or any other school pupils might wish to transfer to would provide support to pupils to aid their transition.
2.6	The Council is not considering the 'rights of the child'	<p>The authority fully respects the rights of children and all actions are taken in the best interest of children. The authority is committed to ensuring that 'all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential'. The authority's view is that the named receiving school can provide high quality education to the children currently attending Nantmel C. in W. School.</p> <p>The Proposal is aligned with the requirements of the Welsh Government's School Organisation Code, which states that 'Relevant bodies should place the interests of learners above all others. With reference to the key questions of the Office of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales (Estyn), they should give paramount importance to the likely impact of the proposals on the quality of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • outcomes (standards and wellbeing); • provision (learning experiences, teaching, care, support and guidance, and learning environment); and • leadership and management (leadership, improving quality, partnership working and resource management)'.
2.7	My children thrive in a small school	The authority acknowledges that some pupils might be happier in a small class /

		school situation, however all schools are expected to ensure that pupils are happy in their learning environment. Should Nantmel C. in W. School close, the receiving school or any other school pupils might wish to transfer to would be expected to provide full support to pupils to aid their transition.
2.8	My child thrives under the wonderful guidance of the school's Foundation Phase teacher	The authority notes this point, and acknowledges that any school reorganisation proposal creates a period of uncertainty for pupils, however should the school close, the receiving school or any other school pupils might wish to transfer to would provide support to pupils to aid their transition. There is no reason to believe that the pupil would not continue to thrive at an alternative school.
2.9	The Council cannot guarantee that the same provision would continue if pupils were to move school	The authority accepts that should Nantmel C. in W. School close, pupils would have to go to bigger schools. However, the authority is satisfied that education of an equivalent standard would be provided to pupils.
2.10	The children are understood so well by their teachers because the teachers only have a small number of pupils to know well	There is no reason to believe that children would not continue to be understood by their teachers in the named receiving school or any other school they may choose to transfer to should Nantmel C. in W. School close. Pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are low and are not expected to increase in the coming years. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity'. The aim of this proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
2.11	How can teachers be expected to know children in as much depth with class sizes near to 30 pupils, along with all the other pressures they face?	There is no evidence to suggest that children learn more in small classes than they do in larger classes. All teachers would be expected to know the children they teach and to meet the needs of each individual pupil through a differentiated curriculum where necessary. The aim of this proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
2.12	No evidence has been provided that shows what impact school closures have on children's outcomes and well-being in their new school – this has been asked for but	There is no evidence to suggest that school closures have any detrimental effect on pupil outcomes or wellbeing. The most recent and relevant example is the closure of 10 primary school and the opening of 4 new primary schools in the Ystradgynlais area. All four school have been classified by Welsh Government as Yellow or Green

	clear examples have not been provided	schools and all four have received very positive inspection reports by Estyn, Her Majesty's Inspectorate for Education and Training in Wales.
2.13	Nantmel School and its grounds offer a unique relationship between parents, staff and community members that you do not find at other schools	The authority notes this comment, however pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are small and are not expected to increase in the next few years. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.' The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
2.14	The strength in partnership will support the school in addressing budgetary pressures by helpful and willing parents, grandparents or community members coming forward to offer their expertise in different areas, e.g. repairs, gardening, cutting the grass	The authority notes this comment, however pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are small and are not expected to increase in the next few years. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.' The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
2.15	Disagree that there will still be 'parental choice' of schools	<p>Whilst the authority has named a receiving school as part of the proposal to close Nantmel C. in W. School, parents could apply for a place at any other school should Nantmel C. in W. School close, therefore parents would still have freedom of choice about what type of school they wished their children to go to.</p> <p>As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.' The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.</p>
2.16	Chose Nantmel School because as well as providing good quality education it provided a safe, friendly, gentle pathway into what will eventually be a busy secondary school life.	<p>The authority notes this comment, however pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are small and are not expected to increase in the next few years. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.'</p> <p>The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Whilst the authority has named a receiving school as part of the proposal to close Nantmel C. in W. School, parents could apply for a place at any</p>

		other school should Nantmel C. in W. School close, therefore parents would still have freedom of choice about what type of school they wished their children to go to.
2.17	While small schools are more expensive to maintain, they provide alternatives to larger schools	<p>The authority notes this comment, however pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are small and are not expected to increase in the next few years. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.'</p> <p>The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Whilst the authority has named a receiving school as part of the proposal to close Nantmel C. in W. School, parents could apply for a place at any other school should Nantmel C. in W. School close, therefore parents would still have freedom of choice about what type of school they wished their children to go to.</p>
2.18	Keeping the small schools is maintaining choice – choice over the ethos parents wish their children to be part of	<p>The authority notes this comment, however pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are small and are not expected to increase in the next few years. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.'</p> <p>The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Whilst the authority has named a receiving school as part of the proposal to close Nantmel C. in W. School, parents could apply for a place at any other school should Nantmel C. in W. School close, therefore parents would still have freedom of choice about what type of school they wished their children to go to.</p>
2.19	The pupils at Nantmel are very well-mannered, polite and respectful, this is noted by others on nearly all school trips. The value of these important social and life skills seems to be seriously undermined by the authority, the consequences of this will be felt in wider society in time to come if you are to continue to 'wipe out' our small school and others.	The authority fully recognises the importance of the social and life skills referred to in this comment. There is no reason to believe that pupils would not continue to be well-mannered, polite and respectful should they attend different schools.
2.20	The consultation process has been	Officers endeavoured to answer all questions posed in the consultation meeting to


	unsatisfactory because the members and officers that attended the public consultation meeting seemed unprepared for the questions they knew they would face.	the best of their abilities, however they did not know beforehand what questions would be asked, therefore it was not possible for them to prepare for this. Responses to all issues raised during the consultation period, including those raised in the consultation meetings, were provided in the consultation report in respect of this proposal.
2.21	There was a significant delay in responding to Freedom of Information requests	There is a defined process for dealing with Freedom of Information requests, which requires authorities to respond within 20 working days. The authority endeavours to respond to such requests within the required timescale.
2.22	The lack of information from the authority coupled with the proposed closures of other local schools quickly led some parents to lose faith and apply for other schools – this was an unfair situation created by the council.	The authority accepts that running consultation on closure of other schools in the local area along a similar timescale to the consultation on closure of Nantmel C. in W. School will have caused concerns for families living closer to Crossgates C.P. School. However, no final decision has yet been made in relation to either Nantmel C. in W. School, Llanbister C.P. School or Llanfihangel Rhydithon C.P. School. At the current time, there are sufficient places available at Crossgates C.P. School, and capacity at this school will be taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to the proposals.
2.23	Names of schools have been mentioned in meetings about making savings which suggests pre-determination of the decision.	The £60,000 projected savings for the 2016/17 referred to in the Council meeting on the 25 th February 2016 was in relation to Whitton (Aided) School, which closed at the end of December 2015.
2.24	Other proposals that have been suggested by the school's governors and parents should have been properly considered with clear reasons given as to why they were discounted	A range of alternative options were considered by the SORP before agreeing the draft recommendation for closure of the school, however the SORP's view was that none of the alternative options were a suitable way forward in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School. These options were listed in the paper considered by Cabinet on the 15 th December 2016 and in the Consultation Document, along with the strengths and weaknesses of each. A number of alternative options were also suggested during the consultation period, and all were listed in the consultation report, which was taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to this proposal.
2.25	You could look more closely at the strengths	A range of alternative options were considered by the SORP before agreeing the

	the current situation provides whether it could be done as a federation or an amalgamation or another collaboration with other schools	<p>draft recommendation for closure of the school, however the SORP's view was that none of the alternative options were a suitable way forward in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School. These options were listed in the paper considered by Cabinet on the 15th December 2016 and in the Consultation Document, along with the strengths and weaknesses of each.</p> <p>A number of alternative options were also suggested during the consultation period, and all were listed in the consultation report, which was taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to this proposal.</p>
2.26	Networking and sharing of good practice already works well, the children are familiar with the current set-up and it would keep provision at Nantmel therefore sustaining our community education.	<p>A range of alternative options were considered by the SORP before agreeing the draft recommendation for closure of the school, however the SORP's view was that none of the alternative options were a suitable way forward in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School. These options were listed in the paper considered by Cabinet on the 15th December 2016 and in the Consultation Document, along with the strengths and weaknesses of each.</p> <p>A number of alternative options were also suggested during the consultation period, and all were listed in the consultation report, which was taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to this proposal.</p>
2.27	School Organisation Code 2013 says special consideration should be given to 'clustering, collaboration or federation taking into account the scope for ICT use between school sites or that reasons should be given for not pursuing these as an alternative'	The options considered in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School are aligned to those contained in the School Transformation Policy (2014). These do not include clustering or collaboration. There is already a degree of clustering and collaboration between primary schools in the catchment.
2.28	There should be more emphasis on how the school can be kept open rather than looking straight to closure for a quick fix answer and we are all willing to work with the council to achieve this.	A range of alternative options were considered by the SORP before agreeing the draft recommendation for closure of the school, however the SORP's view was that none of the alternative options were a suitable way forward in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School. These options were listed in the paper considered by Cabinet on the 15 th December 2016 and in the Consultation Document, along with the strengths and weaknesses of each.

		A number of alternative options were also suggested during the consultation period, and all were listed in the consultation report, which was taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to this proposal.
2.29	Calling on the council to halt this process, think again, look carefully at the alternative options and respond with more clarity.	<p>The authority notes this comment. All issues raised in the Objections received in relation to this proposal will be considered by Cabinet when determining how to proceed.</p> <p>A range of alternative options were considered by the SORP before agreeing the draft recommendation for closure of the school, however the SORP's view was that none of the alternative options were a suitable way forward in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School. These options were listed in the paper considered by Cabinet on the 15th December 2016 and in the Consultation Document, along with the strengths and weaknesses of each.</p> <p>A number of alternative options were also suggested during the consultation period, and all were listed in the consultation report, which was taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to this proposal.</p>
Objection 3		
3.1	School building is used for show meetings, there is no other suitable village in Nantmel village to hold meetings and events	The authority has acknowledged in the community impact assessment that the school building is used for a range of activities, and that closure of the school would impact on this. As the building is owned by the church, it would be a matter for the church to determine the future use of the building should the school close. The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, economic and social factors are non-educational issues.
3.2	In wet windy weather when it is not possible to erect the marquee for Nantmel Show and Sports, the school is used to host the sections where residents have worked hard on exhibits in advance of the show	The authority has acknowledged in the community impact assessment that the school building is used for a range of activities, and that closure of the school would impact on this. As the building is owned by the church, it would be a matter for the church to determine the future use of the building should the school close. The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education

		infrastructure. Ultimately, economic and social factors are non-educational issues.
3.3	The Authority has acknowledged that there is no other building in Nantmel, so why are you still looking to close it?	The authority has acknowledged in the community impact assessment that the school building is used for a range of activities, and that closure of the school would impact on this. As the building is owned by the church, it would be a matter for the church to determine the future use of the building should the school close. The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, economic and social factors are non-educational issues.
3.4	If you do still want to close the school why have you not looked into who the building would go to if the school should close – this should have been sorted before this process was started so the community of Nantmel has a clear understanding as to what will happen.	As the school is owned by the Church, the Church would decide what would happen to the school building should Nantmel C. in W. School close. The authority will enter into discussions with the Church in relation to future use of the school building if necessary depending on the decision made by Cabinet on the way forward in respect of Nantmel C. in W. School.
Objection 4		
4.1	Extremely disappointed that you are still considering to close our village school which has an excellent standard of education, even though you received a huge number of responses during the consultation period.	The authority notes this comment. All issues raised in the consultation responses were outlined in the consultation report, along with the authority's response, and were taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed.
4.2	Are any measures put into place for children who have transferred from one school to another due to school closure and how does the Authority monitor these pupils.	The LA ensures that pupil transition to any new school is as effective and seamless as possible. This includes the carefully planned transfer of pupil information between schools. This includes information on attainment, achievement and standards of pupil wellbeing. The progress and wellbeing of all pupils is monitored regularly by Challenge Advisers.
4.3	Don't want my children to be at a disadvantage to others from having to	The authority notes this comment. The authority accepts that any school reorganisation proposal creates a period of uncertainty for pupils, however should

	change schools through no choice of my own.	the school close, the receiving school or any other school pupils might wish to transfer to would provide support to pupils to aid their transition, and to ensure that they are not disadvantaged.
4.4	Federation with Rhayader would achieve some cost savings and would be a better alternative to outright closure	Under the authority's current funding formula, federation with Rhayader C. in W. School would not realise any savings to the authority.
4.5	You said in your report that the SORP considered federation but it was not considered to be a suitable option – can you show me how this was investigated?	An options appraisal exercise was carried by the SORP, which included the Federation of Nantmel with other schools. This was discounted by the SORP because the SORP felt that it didn't address the issues at Nantmel C. in W. School.
4.6	School transport is not always suitable for working parents, we would have to drive 17 miles out of the way each day to take our children to and from the receiving school.	The authority notes this comment. The authority has a duty to provide home to school transport for qualifying pupils to their closest or allocated school from the home address. The authority cannot take account of individual parents' personal circumstances when planning the routes and timing of the transport provided.
4.7	School transport is no use for parents who wish their children to attend after school activities.	The authority has recognised that all pupils who are transported to school on authority commissioned Home to School Transport do not have the same access to extra-curricular activities that take place outside the school day. Should the school close, the authority would work with the Headteacher and Governing Body of the named receiving school and any other schools pupils might wish to transfer to, to ensure that participation in all school activity is maximised for all learners.
4.8	If the proposal goes ahead, will have no option but to give up work as the income I will earn will be wasted on transported my children to and from school.	Should the proposal to close Nantmel C. in W. School be implemented, free home to school transport would be provided to eligible pupils to the named receiving school or to their closest school. Parents of pupils currently attending Nantmel C. in W. School for whom this is not currently their closest school would also be entitled to transport to their closest school if they were eligible. Parents are entitled to choose for their children to attend a school other than their closest school, however under these circumstances they would be responsible for transporting the child to and from school.
4.9	Agreed by the County Councillor at the public	Since the consultation meeting, a review of the car parking situation at Rhayader C.

	<p>meeting in Nantmel on 25th February that a risk assessment of Rhayader School access would take place. Can I have a copy of the completed risk assessment?</p>	<p>in W. School has been carried out, any remedial work required will be risk assessed and scored in accordance with the Authority's major improvements capital programme and included in the relevant programme in accordance to the score given.</p> <p>The pupils who live within the catchment area of Nantmel and more than two miles from the named receiving school will be provided with county funded home to school transport and therefore the number of additional vehicles on the site at the start and end of day will not be significant.</p> <p>Notes of the Health and Safety Officer's review are provided below:</p> <div style="text-align: center;">  <p>Rhayader parking review.pdf</p> </div>
<p>Objection 5</p>		
<p>5.1</p>	<p>The proposal has a blatant disregard to "Placing the interests of learners above all others" as stated in the School Organisation Code</p>	<p>The authority fully respects the rights of children and all actions are taken in the best interest of children. The authority is committed to ensuring that 'all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential'. The authority's view is that the named receiving school can provide high quality education to the children currently attending Nantmel C. in W. School.</p> <p>The Proposal is aligned with the requirements of the Welsh Government's School Organisation Code, which states that 'Relevant bodies should place the interests of learners above all others. With reference to the key questions of the Office of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales (Estyn), they should give paramount importance to the likely impact of the proposals on the quality of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • outcomes (standards and wellbeing); • provision (learning experiences, teaching, care, support and guidance, and

		<p>learning environment); and</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • leadership and management (leadership, improving quality, partnership working and resource management)'.
5.2	841 people signed a petition against closure of the school to let cabinet know their views. Our view has been disregarded	The petition was taken into consideration by Cabinet at their meeting on 15 th December 2015, when they approved the commencement of consultation on closure of Nantmel C. in W. School. All issues raised during the consultation period were included in the Consultation Report in respect of this proposal, which was taken into consideration by Cabinet when determining how to proceed.
5.3	The consultation document fails to focus on the education and well-being of our children	The consultation document was produced in line with the requirements of the Welsh Government's School Organisation Code.
5.4	The consultation document is misleading, out of context, based on inaccurate information, lacks robust data and fails to present a qualitative view of the situation	The consultation document was produced in line with the requirements of the Welsh Government's School Organisation Code, using the most up-to-date verified information that was available to the Council at the time.
5.5	Average cost per pupils is a crass performance indicator and is misleading	The average cost per pupil is a comparator used across Wales. One of the criteria for reviewing a school as stated in the School Transformation Policy (2014) is 'The cost per pupil is more than 120% of the Council's average for the sector'.
5.6	At the consultation meeting at Llandrindod High School, Ian Roberts stated that "you can use different performance indicators and you can turn those performance around to suit a purpose"	The authority notes this comment.
5.7	Performance indicators are being used in this consultation document to advocate closure.	<p>Nantmel C. in W. School was identified for review as it met the following criteria as outlined in the Schools Transformation Policy (2014):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Pupil Numbers: The school has had fewer than 50 pupils on roll for the three previous years - Capacity: The percentage of surplus places in the school is higher than 15% - Building Condition: The overall building condition is categorised as category

		<p>D or C based on the Welsh Government's assessment of building condition</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Financial: The cost per pupil is more than 120% of the council's average for the sector.
5.8	Overly simplistic cost per pupil figure is a watered down approach to measure performance.	The average cost per pupil is a comparator used across Wales.
5.9	Why are simple statistics being used to solve complex funding issues within the education sector at Powys?	<p>Nantmel C. in W. School was identified for review as it met the following criteria as outlined in the Schools Transformation Policy (2014):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Pupil Numbers: The school has had fewer than 50 pupils on roll for the three previous years - Capacity: The percentage of surplus places in the school is higher than 15% - Building Condition: The overall building condition is categorised as category D or C based on the Welsh Government's assessment of building condition - Financial: The cost per pupil is more than 120% of the council's average for the sector.
5.10	Nantmel budget is in the black and has been run by a careful body of governors, who have sought approval and guidance from the Schools Service at every opportunity	The authority accepts that the school had a surplus of £24,338 at the end of the 2015/16 financial year.
5.11	18 primary schools ran their budget in the red in 2014/15, Nantmel was not one of them	The authority accepts that the school had a surplus of £24,338 at the end of the 2015/16 financial year.
5.12	In order to focus on financial equity, shouldn't the focus be on examining those schools that have not been able to keep within the budget	The authority works continually with all schools to ensure that schools comply with the Scheme for Financing Schools. Nantmel C. in W. School was identified for review as it met a number of the criteria outlined in the authority's School Transformation Policy (2014).
5.13	Acknowledge that the cost per pupil performance indicator has recently been higher than average.	The authority notes this comment.

5.14	Cost per pupil indicator takes the number of pupils at a given date but fails to take account of any pupils moving in and out of the school that affect budgetary costs during the course of the year – schools do not get extra funding for additional pupils until the following year. This can widely distort a small school's outcome.	The cost per pupil is as stated in the authority's annual Section 52 return, which is taken on the day that the funding formula is run, therefore the same number of pupils is used for the whole year.
5.15	Combining factors within the total expenditure can again distort the outcome at a small school – small schools are incredibly vulnerable to wage rises, experienced teachers being on higher scale points, employees on leave (maternity or long term sick) as well as the cost of cover. Those costs distributed amongst a small number of children can reflect in a year a poor performance indicator, but do not adequately explain the long term financial prospects for a school.	All primary schools are funded for the most expensive teachers within the notional teacher number of the school which is driven by pupil numbers. Additional costs due to maternity cover are funded by the authority for contractual staff, schools take out staff absence insurance for sickness.
5.16	Every school is facing a new era in balancing the books due to the council's internal market imposing charges, schools are being scapegoated, paying for corporate services, services once paid for from a central budget.	The authority notes this comment.
5.17	Schools are having to find funds for services that they previously did not have to pay for and are not being given adequate time to analyse and resolve these issues.	The authority notes this comment.
5.18	Closing schools, losing frontline services to	As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary,

	<p>pay for backroom bureaucrats is a quick fix solution to cater for this ongoing internal budgetary reshuffle – it has nothing to do with my child’s education costing fractionally more (according to a PI) than another child’s elsewhere.</p>	<p>secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.’ The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.</p> <p>Nantmel C. in W. School was identified for review as it met the following criteria as outlined in the Schools Transformation Policy (2014):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Pupil Numbers: The school has had fewer than 50 pupils on roll for the three previous years - Capacity: The percentage of surplus places in the school is higher than 15% - Building Condition: The overall building condition is categorised as category D or C based on the Welsh Government’s assessment of building condition - Financial: The cost per pupil is more than 120% of the council’s average for the sector.
5.19	<p>One of the main concerns from Cabinet members has been providing financial equality, let’s make sure that you do provide financial equality for our children and buck the trend of focusing on funding the mechanisms of the Council.</p>	<p>As stated in the One Powys Plan, ‘we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.’ The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.</p>
5.20	<p>Financial equality is not as important as equal opportunity.</p>	<p>The authority notes this comment. The authority is committed to providing equal opportunity to all pupils, in order to ensure that ‘all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential’. The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.</p>
5.21	<p>Consultation document informs us that it will fail the children of Nantmel by not being able to provide transport to allow them to participate in extra-curricular activities, in conflict with the School Organisation Code which states “how parents’ and pupils’ engagement with the alternative school and any facilities it may offer could be supported</p>	<p>The authority has recognised that all pupils who are transported to school on authority commissioned Home to School Transport do not have the same access to extra-curricular activities that take place outside the school day. Should the school close, the authority would work with the Headteacher and Governing Body of the named receiving school and any other schools pupils might wish to transfer to, to ensure that participation in all school activity is maximised for all learners.</p>

	(e.g. how pupils; particularly any less advantaged pupils) will be helped to participate in after school activities”.	
5.22	Strict financial equality across learners will always lead to disadvantage, there will always be children that need more investment and this needs to be accounted for.	The authority recognises that there are children who need more in terms of resourcing to support their learning, and this is accounted for in the ALN delegated budget as well as access to the graduated response to need e.g. top up funding. The ALN budget currently provided to Nantmel C. in W. School is small due to the school’s size and demography, the ALN budget in the alternative schools is significantly larger.
5.23	Budget planning and proposals to make efficiencies are currently being undertaken by the governors to ensure that Nantmel School will present a viable 3 year plan	The authority notes this comment.
5.24	The provision of school dinners could be met more cost effectively than the vague £10,000 lump sum that does not seem to consider how many dinners it produces.	<p>The actual costs for 2015/16 were provided in the consultation report and are as follows:</p> <p><u>Staff costs</u> Cashiers - £834 Cook Preparation - £1,784 Driver - £3,263 General Kitchen Assistant - £1,443</p> <p><u>Other costs</u> Van Costs - £1,693 Provisions - £963</p> <p><u>Total cost £9,980</u></p>
5.25	If Powys County Council could provide a breakdown and detailed costings of school dinners provided to Nantmel, the Governors and community could look at alternative	<p>The actual costs for 2015/16 were provided in the consultation report and are as follows:</p> <p><u>Staff costs</u></p>

	arrangements that may well be more cost effective.	<p>Cashiers - £834 Cook Preparation - £1,784 Driver - £3,263 General Kitchen Assistant - £1,443</p> <p><u>Other costs</u> Van Costs - £1,693 Provisions - £963</p> <p><u>Total cost £9,980</u></p>
5.26	Michaelchurch Escley Primary School is a very remote village school in the black mountains that is local authority maintained. This school uses a local restaurant to provide school dinners.	The authority notes this comment. Any alternative provision would have to be approved by the authority and would need to adhere to the required nutritional standards.
5.27	Concerning that the same travel costs have been apportioned to Llanbister and Nantmel and this brings the accuracy of this figure into doubt.	<p>The figure of £30,400 provided in the consultation document is based on an additional cost of £160 per day. As stated in the consultation meetings, the figure is an estimate based on the expected additional transport costs resulting from the council's proposals.</p> <p>There is a significant difference in the current travel costs between Llanbister C.P. School and Nantmel C. in W. School, and if the proposals go forward the actual additional transport costs incurred would be dependent on the number of parents who choose to send their children to the named receiving school or alternative schools.</p>
5.28	In order to proceed with cost effective solutions and suggestions, the consultation needs to produce a detailed breakdown of journeys and costings.	<p>The figure of £30,400 provided in the consultation document is based on an additional cost of £160 per day. As stated in the consultation meetings, the figure is an estimate based on the expected additional transport costs resulting from the council's proposals.</p> <p>There is a significant difference in the current travel costs between Llanbister C.P. School and Nantmel C. in W. School, and if the proposals go forward the actual</p>

		additional transport costs incurred will be dependent on the number of parents who choose to send their children to the named receiving school or alternative schools.
5.29	20% of Powys' primary schools are under 50 pupils, but Nantmel School has been repeatedly targeted by the council for closure over the years.	<p>The authority is aware that a number of Powys schools have less than 50 pupils. Nantmel C. in W. School was identified for review as it met the following criteria as outlined in the Schools Transformation Policy (2014):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Pupil Numbers: The school has had fewer than 50 pupils on roll for the three previous years - Capacity: The percentage of surplus places in the school is higher than 15% - Building Condition: The overall building condition is categorised as category D or C based on the Welsh Government's assessment of building condition - Financial: The cost per pupil is more than 120% of the council's average for the sector. <p>The authority notes that any school reorganisation process will lead to a period of uncertainty for those affected, however no formal consultation has previously taken place in respect of closure of Nantmel C. in W. School.</p>
5.30	2010/11 – Nantmel faced the threat of closure but was saved due to its higher educational standards above neighbouring schools.	The authority notes this comment, however should Nantmel C. in W. School close, the authority is satisfied that education of an equivalent standard would be provided to pupils at the named receiving school.
5.31	It is acknowledged that Nantmel needs to increase the pupil population for a sustainable future, but in order for this to happen, the schools service needs to relinquish its preoccupation with closing the school in order to allow parents to have the choice.	The authority notes that any school reorganisation process will lead to a period of uncertainty for those affected, however no formal consultation has previously taken place in respect of closure of Nantmel C. in W. School. As stated in the consultation document, there were 36 pupils at Nantmel C. in W. School in January 2011, and pupil numbers have decreased since then. The pupil projections for Nantmel C. in W. School that were considered before this process started did not suggest any significant increase in pupil numbers.
5.32	The pupil population has declined since 2010/11 and has not recovered sufficiently to exceed a WAG expectation of 50 pupils, the	The authority notes this comment. As stated in the consultation document, there were 36 pupils at Nantmel C. in W. School in January 2011, and pupil numbers have decreased since then. The pupil projections for Nantmel C. in W. School that were

	instability perpetuated by Powys reflects in our pupil numbers.	considered before this process started did not suggest any significant increase in pupil numbers. The authority notes that any school reorganisation process will lead to a period of uncertainty for those affected, however no formal consultation has previously taken place in respect of closure of Nantmel C. in W. School.
5.33	Has the council been neglectful in promoting Nantmel School?	No, the council has not been neglectful in promoting Nantmel C. in S. School. Information about Nantmel C. in W. School is included in the authority's Admissions Booklet and on the website, in-line with the information provided about other schools.
5.34	Was not assisted appropriately by Powys Admissions in placing my child in Nantmel, had to insist on him starting.	Information about Nantmel C. in W. School is included in the authority's Admissions Booklet and on the website, in-line with the information provided about other schools. Parents are entitled to apply for a place for their children at any Powys school, and places will be allocated if they are available.
5.35	One of the reasons we chose Nantmel was due to the fact it was a village school and we were not alone – the authority's own figures show that 41% of the children attending do not attend their closest school – this shows that families are seeking such schools, and illustrates that birth rate population data may be a significant contributing factor to school admissions, but it is not the only indicator. However this is too readily focused on.	The authority notes this comment. As stated in the consultation document, there were 36 pupils at Nantmel C. in W. School in January 2011, and pupil numbers have decreased since then. The pupil projections for Nantmel C. in W. School that were considered before this process started did not suggest any significant increase in pupil numbers.
5.36	63% of primary schools in Powys have 15% surplus capacity, so why is this being used as one of the main reasons to close Nantmel School?	Nantmel C. in W. School was identified for review as it met the following criteria as outlined in the Schools Transformation Policy (2014): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Pupil Numbers: The school has had fewer than 50 pupils on roll for the three previous years - Capacity: The percentage of surplus places in the school is higher than 15% - Building Condition: The overall building condition is categorised as category D or C based on the Welsh Government's assessment of building condition - Financial: The cost per pupil is more than 120% of the council's average for the sector.

5.37	Performance indicator related to surplus capacity is based on fresh air, as Gwernyfed Community Council have pointed out: “Any unfilled places are no more significant than an empty unheated classroom with very little cost implication. It is clearly outrageous that Gwernyfed High School should face the axe to offset unmanaged excess capacity elsewhere”.	Although closure of Nantmel C. in W. School would lead to a decrease in overall surplus capacity in Powys schools due to the expected reduction in surplus capacity at the schools to which pupils will transfer, this is not the reason for proposing closure of Nantmel C. in W. School. The school was identified for review based on meeting a number of criteria, as outlined in the School Transformation Policy (2014), one of which was related to surplus places at Nantmel C. in W. School.
5.38	Inappropriate that Nantmel should be closed in order to decrease surplus capacity at Crossgates and Rhayader.	Although closure of Nantmel C. in W. School would lead to a decrease in overall surplus capacity in Powys schools due to the expected reduction in surplus capacity at the schools to which pupils will transfer, this is not the reason for proposing closure of Nantmel C. in W. School. The school was identified for review based on meeting a number of criteria, as outlined in the School Transformation Policy (2014).
5.39	Chipping away at surplus figures to facilitate the current trend in performance indicators from WAG does not seek to serve the best interests of learners.	Nantmel C. in W. School was identified for review as it met a number of criteria as outlined in the Schools Transformation Policy (2014). Only one of these criteria related to surplus capacity. The authority is committed to ensuring that ‘all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential’. The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
5.40	Investigation into surplus capacity at Nantmel has led me to believe that the capacity of 62 is misrepresentative and overstated, best fit with current layout should be capacity of 51	<p>The capacity of a school is calculated in accordance with the Measuring Capacity of Schools in Wales (MCSW) regulations and is based on the school’s use of its current physical facilities. The measurement is undertaken by officers of the authority and checked and confirmed with headteachers and members of the governing body.</p> <p>The authority recognises that if one of the spaces included in the calculation was identified as a non-teaching space the capacity of the school would be reduced.</p>
5.41	Guidance book for calculating capacity states that “if a school has no hall or access to a hall, a suitably sized classroom may be	The capacity of a school is calculated in accordance with the Measuring Capacity of Schools in Wales (MCSW) regulations and is based on the school’s use of its current physical facilities. The measurement is undertaken by officers of the authority and

	deemed to be a hall by the authority for the purposes of the capacity calculation. This means it can be counted as an ancillary area, rather than being counted as a classbase”.	checked and confirmed with headteachers and members of the governing body. The authority recognises that if one of the spaces included in the calculation was identified as a non-teaching space the capacity of the school would be reduced.
5.42	Concerning that the SORP are evaluating data that has not been examined in depth or is wholly inaccurate leading us to the current position on closure.	The data considered as part of the SORP process was the most up-to-date verified data that was available to the authority at the time. The data was discussed and agreed with the governing body of Nantmel C. in W. School before the draft recommendation to close the school was considered by Cabinet.
5.43	Concerning that Headteachers are expected to be on top of a never ending stream of performance indicators instead of actually contributing to the education of our schools, yet in not keeping their eye on the ball with PIs this can lead to the closure of our school.	The authority notes this comment.
5.44	When touring the school, Cabinet members were concerned that children ate lunch in their classroom. Current headteacher has suggested that a simple layout change in the central area could easily solve this issue.	The authority notes this comment. Lunchtime arrangements at the school is not one of the reasons why the authority is proposing closure of Nantmel C. in W. School.
5.45	Reduction in surplus places across the board with these closures will result in larger or maximum number class sizes at receiving / neighbouring schools – this conflict with providing better education and mocks Ian Roberts’ rhetoric that “Our learners are entitled to receive the highest quality of education that can be offered” – perhaps he is actually saying that high quality education cannot now affordably be offered in Powys?	The Proposal is aligned with the requirements of the Welsh Government’s School Organisation Code, which states that ‘Relevant bodies should place the interests of learners above all others. With reference to the key questions of the Office of Her Majesty’s Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales (Estyn), they should give paramount importance to the likely impact of the proposals on the quality of: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • outcomes (standards and wellbeing); • provision (learning experiences, teaching, care, support and guidance, and learning environment); and • leadership and management (leadership, improving quality, partnership working and resource management)’.

		As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.' The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. The authority is committed to ensuring that 'all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential'. The authority's view is that the named receiving school can provide high quality education to the children currently attending Nantmel C. in W. School.
5.46	Nantmel School is rated as yellow and was judged "Good" in the last Estyn inspection.	Educational standards at Nantmel C. in W. School is not one of the reasons why closure of the school is being proposed. However should the school close, the authority is satisfied that education of an equivalent standard would be provided to pupils at the named receiving school.
5.47	The lack of honesty in this consultation process stifles the possibility of a productive outcome for the school.	The consultation process has been carried out in line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code using the most up-to-date verified data that was available to the Council at the time.
5.48	The consultation document refers to two other Church in Wales schools less than 5 miles from Nantmel. Trefonnen has 14.62% surplus capacity whilst Newbridge has 13.08%. Parents have been panicked over the council's desire to close Nantmel as it has been a recurring theme historically, to ensure that their next choice is within their control, favouring a rural C in W School, so some parents have completed applications in advance for Newbridge School to ensure that if the decision was made to close the school, they would be guaranteed a place in September 2016 for all their children.	No final decision has yet been made on the future of Nantmel C. in W. School, however parents are free to choose to move their children to different schools if that is their wish.
5.49	The Council's admissions team have placed pressure on parents urging them to leave Nantmel now as otherwise they would lose	Members of the admissions team have taken enquiries from parents of pupils at Nantmel C. in W. School in respect of the process that would be followed in respect of closure of the school and if the parents decide to move their child/ren before the

	<p>their places – this illustrates a lack of capacity at Newbridge in the relevant year groups and again mocks this performance indicator</p>	<p>closure takes place. The parents were informed that the authority has a duty to provide a place in the named receiving school, Rhayader C. in W. School for the children in Nantmel and that the authority would work with parents to meet their parental wishes if they chose a different school, other than the named receiving school.</p> <p>The team also informed the parents who enquired of the process the authority follows in respect of allocating places in accordance with the authority's admissions procedures, which included informing them that the authority does not hold places for children to be admitted to a school at the start of future terms or half terms and that the places for in year transfers are allocated during the half term prior to the proposed transfer date.</p>
5.50	<p>Powys Schools Service is putting families under unnecessary stress and pressure using underhand techniques in diminishing the Nantmel school population in favour of their predetermined, preferred option of closure.</p>	<p>The authority accepts that any school reorganisation proposal creates a period of uncertainty for those affected. The authority is not using 'underhand tactics' in order to diminish the school population at Nantmel C. in W. School. Rather, the authority is following the legal process for school reorganisation proposals. No final decision has yet been made on the future of Nantmel C. in W. School, however parents are free to choose to move their children to different schools if that is their wish.</p>
5.51	<p>An additional knock on effect as this is causing distress for families in the Newbridge area, as they are being forced to appeal in admissions every year.</p>	<p>The authority acts as the admissions authority for all Community and Church Controlled Schools and allocated places in accordance with each individual school's capacity and admissions numbers.</p>
5.52	<p>Limited spaces available at Trefonnen.</p>	<p>The authority is aware of the current situation in the schools in the Llandrindod Wells catchment area.</p>
5.53	<p>Failure of the consultation to adhere to an academic year outlines the Schools Service's lack of commitment to offering the best to our children.</p>	<p>The authority notes this comment.</p>
5.54	<p>Proposing to close a school in December is another underhand technique to manipulate</p>	<p>The authority did not propose closing the school in December in order to manipulate parents into leaving before a decision has been made.</p>

	families in leaving before a decision has been made, diminishing numbers and budgets	
5.55	Many families have been distressed by the consultation to close Llanbister and Llanfihangel Rhydithon along a similar timescale – again this reinforces the concept that the Schools Service are manipulating proceedings where families are worried about competing for places at Crossgates School.	The authority accepts that running consultation on closure of Llanbister C.P. School and Llanfihangel Rhydithon C.P. School along a similar timescale to the consultation on closure of Nantmel C. in W. School will have caused concerns for families living closer to Crossgates C.P. School. However, no final decision has yet been made in relation to either Nantmel C. in W. School, Llanbister C.P. School or Llanfihangel Rhydithon C.P. School. At the current time, there are sufficient places available at Crossgates C.P. School, and capacity at this school will be taken in to consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to the proposals.
5.56	The council is attempting to pit community against community.	The authority is not attempting to pit community against community.
5.57	If Nantmel is given the opportunity by the council to re-establish and promote itself, the number of pupils can increase	As stated in the consultation document, there were 36 pupils at Nantmel C. in W. School in January 2011, and pupil numbers have decreased since then. The pupil projections for Nantmel C. in W. School that were considered before this process started did not suggest any significant increase in pupil numbers. The authority notes that any school reorganisation process will lead to a period of uncertainty for those affected, however no formal consultation has previously taken place in respect of closure of Nantmel C. in W. School.
5.58	Reference to Michaelchurch Escley School in Herefordshire, which is in a more rural location than Nantmel and faced closure in 2013 due to falling pupil numbers. The school now has a waiting list, as their website states “We remodelled our staffing establishment to ensure we could remain sustainable in the long term, and together with a highly effective marketing campaign (led by a governor and enacted jointly by governors, staff and parents) we saw our numbers double in a year meaning that our finances are on a	The authority notes this comment and the reference to Michaelchurch Escley School. As stated in the consultation document, there were 36 pupils at Nantmel C. in W. School in January 2011, and pupil numbers at the school have decreased since then. The pupil projections for Nantmel C. in W. School that were considered before this process started did not suggest any significant increase in pupil numbers. The authority is committed to ensuring that ‘all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential’, and the aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.

	secure footing”	
5.59	Nantmel is in an idyllic setting and has the facilities to offer new ideas such as “Work experience based play learning” as an alternative to the standard model, exploring different ways of teaching, could attract new parents who are interested in this approach.	The authority notes this comment.
5.60	Nantmel has all of the facilities to facilitate these options unlike most town schools.	The authority notes this comment.
5.61	We believe that a mixed age class is of benefit to our child’s social and learning outcomes	The authority notes this comment and acknowledges that there are good examples in both mixed age classes and single age classes.
5.62	We oppose the council’s previous transformation policy to move away from mixed age groups – again this was a policy that lacked substance as 90% of primary schools in Powys have mixed age classes with 46% of schools having classes with more than 2 year groups.	The authority notes this comment, and acknowledges that a large number of Powys schools have mixed age classes.
5.63	Moving from an urban neighbourhood, have seen the demand for schools that embrace these things, this was one of the reasons why we moved back here.	The authority notes this comment, however as stated in the consultation document, there were 36 pupils at Nantmel C. in W. School in January 2011, and pupil numbers at the school have decreased since then. The pupil projections for Nantmel C. in W. School that were considered before this process started did not suggest any significant increase in pupil numbers. The authority is committed to ensuring that ‘all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential’, and the aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
5.64	Nantmel School could offer flexi schooling for parents who want more input into their	Flexi schooling is a situation where a child attends a school for part of the week and for the rest of the week is taught by their parent under Elective Home Education

	<p>children's learning, this is offered at Michaelchurch Escley School with success.</p>	<p>arrangements. There is no statutory entitlement of a parent to receive flexi schooling and it can only take place if the school and the parent are in agreement as to how it will operate, and how the child will cope with work that has taken place when the child is being taught by his / her parents.</p> <p>Schools often are not keen to go down the road of flexi schooling as the time when the child is being taught by their parents is recorded an unauthorised absence at the school, affecting the total absence figures in relation to the school. Schools are now being scrutinised very carefully in relation to attendance figures and, as indicated above, flexi schooling can operate against a school's ranking in relation to attendance. Schools usually consider requests for flexi schooling on a case-by-case basis.</p>
5.65	<p>Flexi schooling would cater for children who have special requirements or children who have difficulty managing the whole school day or week</p>	<p>Flexi schooling is a situation where a child attends a school for part of the week and for the rest of the week is taught by their parent under Elective Home Education arrangements. There is no statutory entitlement of a parent to receive flexi schooling and it can only take place if the school and the parent are in agreement as to how it will operate, and how the child will cope with work that has taken place when the child is being taught by his / her parents.</p> <p>Schools often are not keen to go down the road of flexi schooling as the time when the child is being taught by their parents is recorded an unauthorised absence at the school, affecting the total absence figures in relation to the school. Schools are now being scrutinised very carefully in relation to attendance figures and, as indicated above, flexi schooling can operate against a school's ranking in relation to attendance. Schools usually consider requests for flexi schooling on a case-by-case basis.</p>
5.66	<p>An increasing number of families are disillusioned with the education system and are opting for home education, a growing trend.</p>	<p>The authority wants all Powys children to be a part of its schools community and has the utmost confidence in the quality of education delivered by its schools. It is however, the decision of parents as to how best to educate their children and that includes the option of delivering it at home</p>
5.67	<p>Acknowledge that flexi schooling is an issue with regard to attendance as this is not</p>	<p>Flexi schooling is a situation where a child attends a school for part of the week and for the rest of the week is taught by their parent under Elective Home Education</p>

	considered appropriately for Performance Indicators, another example where Performance Indicators work against our children.	<p>arrangements. There is no statutory entitlement of a parent to receive flexi schooling and it can only take place if the school and the parent are in agreement as to how it will operate, and how the child will cope with work that has taken place when the child is being taught by his / her parents.</p> <p>Schools often are not keen to go down the road of flexi schooling as the time when the child is being taught by their parents is recorded an unauthorised absence at the school, affecting the total absence figures in relation to the school. Schools are now being scrutinised very carefully in relation to attendance figures and, as indicated above, flexi schooling can operate against a school's ranking in relation to attendance. Schools usually consider requests for flexi schooling on a case-by-case basis.</p>
5.68	Inappropriate that extracting information from the Council is based on how loud you should, who you know and is reliant on the person asking the question being aware intimately of council function.	The authority refutes this statement. There is a defined Freedom of Information process for dealing with requests for information from members of the public, which requires the authority to respond within 20 working days. The authority endeavours to respond to such requests within the required timescale.
5.69	Asking for information during a consultation via an actual FOI department is more of a hindrance to this process.	There is a defined process for dealing with Freedom of Information requests, which requires the authority to respond within 20 working days. The authority endeavours to respond to such requests within the required timescale.
5.70	Building reports produced in 2009 commissioned by WAG are not fit for purpose.	The authority notes this comment. The authority has agreed with the governing body that with some work to the fabric of the school the overall condition would improve to a Condition B.
5.71	Building reports have been described by an officer as "High Level Conditions Survey" and "that little commentary accompanied the reports".	The authority notes this comment. The authority has agreed with the governing body that with some work to the fabric of the school the overall condition would improve to a Condition B.
5.72	Believe that officers have recognised that the data is unsatisfactory and have been told that from April 2016 a rolling programme of	The authority has recognised during the consultation process that the condition assessments are aged, and the Cabinet has approved a rolling programme of updated condition assessments. As part of the consultation, the authority did

	surveys will be undertaken as part of the School Service Asset Management Plan.	commission a reassessment of the buildings at Nantmel and confirmed that with limited expenditure the building could be brought up to a condition B.
5.73	Simplistic statistics provided by the building reports are inconsistent and inaccurate but are being used in this consultation document to advocate closure.	The authority notes this comment. The authority has agreed with the governing body that with some work to the fabric of the school the overall condition would improve to a Condition B.
5.74	Cabinet members will have witnessed that Nantmel School is a traditional stone building of sturdy construction residing in a spacious rural setting.	The authority notes this comment. The authority has agreed with the governing body that with some work to the fabric of the school the overall condition would improve to a Condition B.
5.75	The original building if maintained will serve another century, unlike the receiving school which has been graded inconsistently better on some outcomes by ECHarris Consultancy in 2009	The authority notes this comment. The authority has agreed with the governing body that with some work to the fabric of the school the overall condition would improve to a Condition B. The authority notes the comment in respect of the named receiving school.
5.76	Wilmott Dixon the contractor who built Trefonnen C in W School would only have given a warranty that would be a fraction of the age of Nantmel's school building.	Trefonnen C. in W. School has been built with a life expectancy of 60 years in accordance with the Authority and the Welsh Government's aspirations, subject to the authority and governing body making the required periodic building investment into the school buildings and fabric.
5.77	Nantmel only needs limited modernisation in terms of double glazing on some of the windows	The authority has agreed with the governing body that with some work to the fabric of the school the overall condition of the school would improve to a Condition B. However, this work would not address the suitability issues at the school.
5.78	An officer from Regeneration and Corporate Property disputes the report from ECHarris consultancy on disabled access – 'the DDA access is graded D and comments no disabled access, this is not the case as there are ramps and handrails in place however the gradients or design may not be up to	The authority notes the comment in respect of the multi-level nature of the named receiving school in Rhayader. The authority has a multidisciplinary officer team who identify any adaptations required to schools to allow access in line with DDA requirements of children who are expected to attend the school in the short to medium term. The adaptations required are dependent on the specific needs of the individual child and are therefore planned to be undertaken in the year prior to the child's admission to the school.

	current standards’.	
5.79	Nantmel School is all on one level, yet Rhayader has been graded C on its disabled access, higher than Nantmel, but it would be impossible to manoeuvre around the maze of staircases in its “purpose built secondary” school building.	The authority notes the comment in respect of the multi-level nature of the named receiving school in Rhayader. The authority has a multidisciplinary officer team who identify any adaptations required to schools to allow access in line with DDA requirements of children who are expected to attend the school in the short to medium term. The adaptations required are dependent on the specific needs of the individual child and are therefore planned to be undertaken in the year prior to the child’s admission to the school.
5.80	Vital that these reports are not used as they are out of context and detrimental in isolation.	<p>One of the criteria for reviewing a school as stated in the authority’s School Transformation Policy (2014) is as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The overall building condition is categorised as category D or C based on the Welsh Government’s assessment of building condition. <p>Further to this, the Welsh Government’s School Organisation Code requires authorities to provide the following information in consultation documents:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Information about the quality of accommodation at all existing schools likely to be affected by the proposals including reference to the condition category of the school as identified by the 21st Century Schools Survey.
5.81	If common sense prevailed, Nantmel in context with every other school building should not fall anywhere near the bottom half.	The authority has agreed with the governing body that with some work to the fabric of the school the overall condition of the school would improve to a Condition B. However, this work would not address the suitability issues at the school. The authority’s strategic aim is to bring all its school buildings up to a minimum of condition B over the next 25 years.
5.82	Can only suggest that Llanfihangel Rhydithon and Llanbister along with the 18 other condition C primaries scrutinise their reports contextually to other schools in Powys to see the misrepresentation being made	The authority notes this comment.

5.83	Of concern that by increasing capacity in schools such as Crossgates, PCC will be placing more reliance on the use of mobile classrooms.	The authority recognises that the capacity of 240 at Crossgates C.P. School includes the use of a single mobile classroom in addition to the 7 permanent class bases.
5.84	40% of primary schools in Powys have mobile classrooms – Nantmel is not one of them, yet some of the children that will be moved from Nantmel to Crossgates may end up in temporary accommodation.	The authority recognises that the capacity of 240 at Crossgates C.P. School includes the use of a single mobile classroom in addition to the 7 permanent class bases.
5.85	Direct conflict with Powys School Transformation Policy which states “The aim of the new transformation policy is to establish an infrastructure for schools which: Minimises dependency on temporary accommodation”.	The authority recognises that the capacity of 240 at Crossgates C.P. School includes the use of a single mobile classroom in addition to the 7 permanent class bases.
5.86	The costs and responsibility of ensuring the school premises meet legal requirements could be outsourced to the local community or a community cooperative that includes parents, community members and governors.	The authority notes this comment.
5.87	Finance could be raised through charitable donations, fundraising, community precept or private investment.	The authority notes this comment.
5.88	Survey from EC Harris outlines that the priority level on maintenance is a 3, with the exception of the windows which is a 2 (3-5 years). This time limit has already expired and PCC have failed to address the windows.	The authority has recognised the significant backlog in its repairs and maintenance requirements at all its schools and has identified an increase in the Major Repairs Capital building and improvements budget for the 2017-18 financial year.
5.89	I am confident that the local community	The authority has recognised the significant backlog in its repairs and maintenance

	would do no less of a job and could address this within a reasonable timeframe.	requirements at all its schools and has identified an increase in the Major Repairs Capital building and improvements budget for the 2017-18 financial year.
5.90	Would be useful if Powys could provide to the community any expenditure on maintenance upgrades and a report on jobs undertaken that have taken place in the last 10 years to evaluate further whether this could be feasible.	The authority can provide a list of the jobs undertaken over the last ten years together with an updated condition and suitability assessment which would identify the main works required on the building.
5.91	How can the employment of a headteacher that is free to resign at will be described as “Permanency”?	Any employee in any organisation is at liberty to resign from their post at any point in time. The description of leadership arrangements as ‘permanent’ refers to a situation where a headteacher has a permanent contract, as opposed to acting headteachers who have temporary contracts or situations where there are temporary shared headteacher arrangements in place.
5.92	Nine months ago Nantmel had “permanent” leadership arrangements in place. Governors assisted the council by agreeing to share the head with Dolau School, recognising that there could be advantages to a non-teaching head whilst being cost aware – Nantmel governors were trying to please the Schools Service and illustrate their willingness to adapt and change. Permanent headteacher later chose to take up a vacant position at Crossgates School just before Nantmel received news of this proposal.	The authority accepts that this is a true reflection of the position.
5.93	Was the future/closure of Nantmel being planned/predetermined at/before the point when the headteacher left?	The previous headteacher at Nantmel C. in W. School applied for a vacant headteacher position and was appointed by the governing body following interview. This was not part of any strategic move by the authority.
5.94	Recruitment of headteachers is a nationwide problem.	The authority acknowledges that recruitment of headteachers is a nationwide problem, and is a particular issue in rural authorities.

5.95	Reducing the number of schools and reducing the teacher pool reduces the pool for those wishing to proceed into headteaching	The authority acknowledges that recruitment of headteachers is a nationwide problem, and is a particular issue in rural authorities. The authority is working to identify and support leaders of the future within the local authority.
5.96	Is closing every school that cannot find a headteacher PCC's sustainable solution?	Recruitment of headteachers is a nationwide problem, and is a particular issue in rural authorities. The local authority works with governing bodies to identify alternative solutions to address the challenge. The lack of permanent leadership arrangements at Nantmel C. in W. School is not one of the reasons listed in the consultation document why the authority is currently proposing closure of the school.
5.97	Schools Service has been whimsical in their policy making – previous school transformation policy outlined a wish to have no “teaching heads” – an outlandish proposal in an area where 42% of primary schools have a headteacher with classroom responsibility.	The authority acknowledges that a large number of headteachers in Powys have classroom responsibility, however it remains the authority’s aspiration to minimise headteachers’ classroom responsibility in order to enable them to focus on leadership and management of the school.
5.98	Newbridge School would not be cost effective without a teaching head.	The authority notes this comment.
5.99	If Nantmel is being judged in isolation and unjustly, was the suggestion of federation with Rhayader, an idea that came from the Schools Service, a precursor to this current consultation and the demise of the school?	The Schools Service assisted the governors of Nantmel C. in W. School to secure leadership of the school following the resignation of the previous headteacher. Rhayader C. in W. School was approached as the nearest Church in Wales school.
5.100	Gladestry – an outstanding school that has a teaching head, not sure why this cannot be explored again as an option for Nantmel – especially as the Council is unlikely to fulfil the possibility of removing all teaching heads.	The authority acknowledges that there are small schools in Powys that have headteachers, and that each of these headteachers have varying levels of teaching commitment. However in general headteacher posts advertised for small schools do not generate a high level of interest.

5.101	Scenario of executive and associate headteachers shared with other village schools – one executive headteacher for several small schools, whilst each school has a teaching deputy / associate. The teaching deputy could be a trainee headteacher, helping to create a long term solution to the recruitment process.	The authority notes this comment. The authority is already identifying potential leaders and providing appropriate support and guidance.
5.102	Advantage of sharing an executive over several village schools would be that the focus is on the rural school, tackling issues that are unique to small schools, celebrating their individuality and offering an alternative choice to the larger town school in an area that does not have free schools, academies or private schools	The authority notes this comment.
5.103	An independent school in Nottingham has just been rated outstanding by Ofsted. They do not believe in a hierarchical management style and therefore the headship is run by a committee.	The authority notes this comment.
5.104	Failure by the schools service to acknowledge that the proposal could have negative issues for the children undergoing the change	The authority has acknowledged that any school reorganisation proposal creates a period of uncertainty for the pupils affected.
5.105	Consultation document fails to outline provision to ensure the social health and wellbeing of our children	The authority has acknowledged that any school reorganisation proposal creates a period of uncertainty for the pupils affected. Should the school close, the receiving school or any other school pupils might wish to transfer to would provide support to pupils to aid their transition. Whilst this was not specifically noted in the consultation document itself, this issue was raised extensively during the consultation process as being a concern for parents, and was included in the consultation report that was

		considered by Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to this proposal.
5.106	Want to know what special measures can or will Powys put in place to ensure the wellbeing of our children due to the disruption of their education, friendship groups and their stable daily routine in a nurtured environment they know and trust?	The LA ensures that pupil transition to any new school is as effective and seamless as possible. This includes the carefully planned transfer of pupil information between schools. This includes information on attainment, achievement and standards of pupil wellbeing. These arrangements would include visits to receiving schools by pupils and regular staff meetings to ensure that any necessary support is in place before the transfer of pupils. The progress and wellbeing of all pupils is monitored regularly by Challenge Advisers.
5.107	Since the consultation started, a family chose to move their child from Nantmel due to the stressful effect of this consultation on their family, they were fearful that they would not get a place at their next school of choice and so they moved early hoping for stability. Within a few weeks at the new school, the child had been deregistered for the purposes of home schooling as the school had failed to meet the needs of the child.	The authority notes this comment. The authority has acknowledged that any school reorganisation proposal creates a period of uncertainty for the pupils affected. No final decision has yet been made on the future of Nantmel C. in W. School, however parents are free to choose to move their children to different schools if that is their wish, or to make a decision to home school the children. The authority has no reason to believe that the named receiving school or any other school pupils may wish to transfer to would not be able to meet the needs of the pupils currently attending Nantmel C. in W. School.
5.108	This situation is very unsettling, and the Schools Service refuse to acknowledge the detrimental effect this can have on our children.	The authority has acknowledged that any school reorganisation proposal creates a period of uncertainty for the pupils affected.
5.109	Would like the Cabinet if they choose to close this school to explain to us parents how they speak out and represent the vulnerable?	<p>'Transforming learning and skills' is one of the priorities in the One Powys Plan, and within this priority, the plan states the authority's aspiration to ensure that 'all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential'. This aspiration relates to all pupils, including vulnerable pupils. Whilst the authority accepts that any school reorganisation proposal creates a period of uncertainty, the authority is committed to ensure the best possible opportunities are available to all pupils.</p> <p>An equality impact assessment was carried out, and was considered by Cabinet before making the decision to commence consultation in relation to closure of</p>

		Nantmel C. in W. School, and was included in the consultation document. This was updated following the consultation period to include information received in consultation responses, and was considered by Cabinet when determining whether or not to proceed with the proposal.
5.110	Consultation document overwhelmingly fails to outline the impact on staff	The proposal's impact on staff is covered on page 10 of the consultation document. A separate consultation meeting with staff was held during the consultation period, to give staff the opportunity to raise any issues relating to the proposal's impact on them. The issues raised relating to impact on staff were included in the consultation report. If the closure goes ahead a further consultation process will be conducted with the staff.
5.111	When asking for data from PCC on the 1 st Jan 2016, the database states that there are 35 'positions' at the school, a figure that defies logic, and which internal service charges use to increase costs to the school. This did not reflect the scenario and has been corrected.	The authority notes this comment, however as stated, this issue has now been resolved.
5.112	Up until recently there were 8 employees at the school, 1 has already left to take up a permanent position elsewhere due to the threat of closure.	The authority note this comment.
5.113	7 of the school's 8 employees are female.	The authority notes this comment.
5.114	Consultation report fails to address the human aspect of who the school's employees are – mothers, daughters, sisters in the community, and the affect of their loss of earnings on their families in our rural communities where wages are already too low.	The authority notes this comment.

5.115	Will the redundancy packages really compensate for loss of earnings? Will our employees be entitled to redundancy based on their contractual status or length of service? The report fails to address this.	<p>A redundancy payment is compensation because your job has disappeared. There are two sorts of redundancy pay:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Statutory redundancy pay, which is set down by law - Contractual statutory pay, which applies for employment in Powys County Council. The details are set out in the relevant Redundancy Policy (Teaching or Support Staff) <p>You cannot be paid less redundancy pay than the amount of statutory redundancy pay you are entitled to. If your contractual redundancy scheme gives you less money than the statutory amount, you must still get the statutory amount.</p> <p>Further information will be given to staff at a formal staff consultation meeting should the proposal go ahead.</p>
5.116	Page 12 of the consultation document states 'No capital funding is required in order to achieve the proposal'.	Since the consultation meeting, a review of the car parking situation at Rhayader C in W School has been carried out, any remedial work required will be risk assessed and scored in accordance with the Authority's major improvements capital programme and included in the relevant programme in accordance to the score given.
5.117	School buildings reports from EC Harris 2009 have neglected to report on access and car parking arrangements for the schools and no other information has been provided by the authority.	Since the consultation meeting, a review of the car parking situation at Rhayader C in W School has been carried out, any remedial work required will be risk assessed and scored in accordance with the Authority's major improvements capital programme and included in the relevant programme in accordance to the score given.
5.118	It is clear from visiting the school and complaints from parents and governors at Rhayader that the parking is not fit for purpose, pot holed with limited space, one way access with limited passing and no designated parking spaces.	<p>The authority recognises that access to Rhayader C. in W. School is not of the highest quality. However, the entrance has been assessed on a number of occasions by a Health and Safety Officer and it does meet the authority's requirements. However, it will continue to be monitored by both the school and the local authority.</p> <p>The number of car parking spaces at the school is lower than the number that would be provided for a new school but are in line with the number of places at similar sized older schools. The majority of children currently attending Nantmel C. in W. School</p>

		<p>would be transported to the school, which limit the proposal's impact on parking arrangements on a day to day basis.</p> <p>The authority notes the comment in relation to pot holes in the car park and has discussed this situation with the Headteacher and Governing Body of Rhayader C. in W. School.</p>
5.119	On a daily basis the parking is inadequate for the current school population, it is worse on a rainy day, the problem exacerbated by the town school not actually being located in the town and the reluctance of residents to walk.	<p>The authority recognises that access to Rhayader C. in W. Shool is not of the highest quality. However, the entrance has been assessed on a number of occasions by a Health and Safety Officer and it does meet the authority's requirements. However, it will continue to be monitored by both the school and the local authority.</p> <p>Should Nantmel C. in W. School close, and pupils transferred to Rhayader C. in W. School, the authority would work with and support the school in developing and implementing a traffic management scheme at the start and end of the school day.</p>
5.120	Closure of Nantmel School will result in an increase in buses and cars to a site that is not fit for purpose.	<p>The authority recognises that access to Rhayader C. in W. Shool is not of the highest quality. However, the entrance has been assessed on a number of occasions by a Health and Safety Officer and it does meet the authority's requirements. However, it will continue to be monitored by both the school and the local authority.</p>
5.121	There was an emergency situation where a child was trapped in a vehicle that caught fire but the emergency services were unable to access the car park due to the problems issued above.	<p>The authority recognises that access to Rhayader C. in W. Shool is not of the highest quality. However, the entrance has been assessed on a number of occasions by a Health and Safety Officer and it does meet the authority's requirements. However, it will continue to be monitored by both the school and the local authority.</p> <p>Should Nantmel C. in W. School close, and pupils transferred to Rhayader C. in W. School, the authority would work with and support the school in developing and implementing a traffic management scheme at the start and end of the school day.</p>
5.122	Would like the Council to explain how this would be redressed for the ongoing safety of our children without capital funding at the receiving school?	<p>Since the consultation meeting, a review of the car parking situation at Rhayader C in W School has been carried out, any remedial work required will be risk assessed and scored in accordance with the Authority's major improvements capital programme and included in the relevant programme in accordance to the score given.</p>

5.123	Nantmel School has ample car parking and safe visibility splays for junction access, and even accommodates the rural family combining the school run with work.	The authority notes this comment.
5.124	Would like the Schools Modernisation team to note the distress caused to families by not allowing the consultation to run alongside the academic year.	The authority notes this comment.
5.125	Has been unsettling for the school to have the consultation deadline extended due to omissions made by the modernisation team – if the community or school had wished for an extension it would not have been so easily granted, this is an unfair one sided approach.	The authority notes this comment. The consultation period was extended in order to ensure that all stakeholders as listed in the School Organisation Code had at least 42 days to respond to the consultation.
5.126	The length of time will have a knock on effect for Cabinet to make their decision – if it has not already been predetermined.	It is true that the extension to the consultation period will have an effect on the time it will take for Cabinet to make a decision in relation to the school. The final decision in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School has not been predetermined.
5.127	Consultation proceedings at different schools have not been consistent – explicitly asked to record the consultation meeting, and this was refused following advice from your legal department. However, Llanbister School were allowed to record their meeting and you have since facilitated the recording of the high school consultations.	<p>In order for the meeting to be recorded, all those present would need to have given informed consent for this to happen. At the consultation meeting at Llanbister C.P. School, a request was made by a member of the audience just before the meeting started to record the meeting. The audience member had received informed consent from informed consent from those present. The panel agreed that they were comfortable with the meeting being recorded. The authority accepts that this was inconsistent with the response given to the request to record the meeting at Nantmel. The recent primary consultation meetings held at Llanfihangel Rhydithon C.P. School, Ysgol Dolafon, Bronllys C.P. School and Talgarth C.P. School were not recorded.</p> <p>In respect of the meetings at the high schools, the authority facilitated the recording of these meetings as there were concerns that there would be insufficient capacity to</p>

		accommodate all those that wished to attend the meetings. Attendees were advised that the meetings would be recorded when booking tickets for the events, therefore informed consent had been received.
5.128	You actively disadvantaged the consultees of Nantmel, then despite having three note takers took 15 days to release the minutes, which was the maximum time allowed.	<p>The authority does not agree that the consultees of Nantmel were disadvantaged.</p> <p>Historically, minutes of consultation meetings have not been released to the public. However, following requests from members of the Nantmel community, the authority agreed that minutes would be released within 15 working days of the date of the meeting, and the minutes were provided within this timescale. The authority's view is that this is reasonable.</p>
5.129	PCC should help to form a collaborative working group with the rural communities of Powys that still have small schools to find innovative solutions, create collaborative links and working practices that will allow our small schools to thrive and be a celebrated success in Powys.	<p>A range of alternative options were considered by the SORP before agreeing the draft recommendation for closure of the school, however the SORP's view was that none of the alternative options were a suitable way forward in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School.</p> <p>All alternative options suggested as part of the consultation were included in the consultation report which was considered by Cabinet when determining how to proceed in respect of this proposal, however Cabinet's view was that these were not suitable solutions in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School.</p> <p>The aim of this proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.</p>
5.130	That PCC stops fulfilling the demands of performance indicators that fly in the face of Powys Education set up due to its rural nature and focuses on providing education in the community.	The authority is committed to providing the best possible educational opportunities for pupils. The One Powys Plan states the authority's aspiration to ensure that 'all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential', and within this priority, the Plan states that 'we need to 're-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity'. The aim of this proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
5.131	PCC and Councillors need to lobby the Welsh Assembly Government and working	The authority notes this comment.

	groups to ensure Powys does not fall foul of urban policy models.	
5.132	We recognise that education needs to change and there are always ways to improve, and that with limited funds this needs to be addressed through partnership working with the community. Would like to see a policy and culture change at the Council that genuinely allows this to happen.	<p>A range of alternative options were considered by the SORP before agreeing the draft recommendation for closure of the school, however the SORP's view was that none of the alternative options were a suitable way forward in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School.</p> <p>All alternative options suggested as part of the consultation were included in the consultation report which was considered by Cabinet when determining how to proceed in respect of this proposal, however Cabinet's view was that these were not suitable solutions in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School.</p> <p>The aim of this proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.</p>
5.133	Nantmel School has provided education to its rural community for 160 years, the community wishes for this to continue and we have the ideal infrastructure to provide an exceptional school.	The authority accepts that Nantmel C. in W. School has provided education for the local community over many years. However pupil numbers at the school are low, and are not expected to increase. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity'. The aim of this proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
5.134	Urge Cabinet members to prove that the consultation was at a formative stage, and that we can go forward in partnership.	The authority notes this comment. All issues raised during the consultation period, were taken into consideration by Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to the school, and all issues raised in the Objections will be taken into consideration when making a final decision. No final decision has yet been made.
5.135	Nantmel is a rural community that cannot be compared to a town school, such comparison fails to recognise the nurtured environment that rural schools offer.	The authority notes this comment, however pupil numbers in Nantmel C. in W. School are low and are not expected to increase significantly. Whilst Rhayader C. in W. School, the named receiving school, is located in the town of Rhayader, the school serves a wide catchment area, and the pupils that attend are a mixture of pupils living within Rhayader and pupils living in the rural area surrounding Rhayader. The authority is confident that Rhayader C. in W. School, and any other school pupils may wish to transfer to, would be able to meet the needs of children

		from a rural background.
5.136	Powys' approach to learning where one size fits all fails to celebrate small rural schools.	The authority's revised Schools Organisation Policy, approved by Cabinet in November 2015, acknowledges that 'In a rural county as diverse as Powys there is no one size fits all approach to school organisation. Consideration will be given to the specific circumstances of each school/s and community.' A range of options were taken into consideration by the School Organisation Review Panel before agreeing the draft recommendation in relation to closure of the school.
5.137	Time and time again Nantmel punches above its weight where educational and well-being standards never fall below par.	In the National Categorisation of Schools, Welsh Government judged standards at Nantmel C. in W. School as 3.
5.138	Whilst the council pleads for more funding from WAG based on the concept of rurality being a deprivation, closing the most basic solitary village services such as the school is an affront to the extra funding bargained for from WAG.	The authority notes this comment. However, pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are low and are not expected to increase in the coming years. The aim of this proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, economic and social factors are non-educational issues.
5.139	Clear that PCC are looking for the most straight forward route to solving a funding crisis rather than rising to the challenge of providing education in our local area.	The authority does not agree with this comment. A range of options were considered by the SORP when agreeing the draft recommendation in respect of Nantmel C. in W. School, however none of the alternative options were considered to be suitable solutions. Pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are low and are not expected to increase in the coming years. The aim of this proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
5.140	This funding crisis has evolved over an extensive period of time, and doesn't have an instant fix.	The authority notes this comment.
5.141	This is not in the best interests of our learners or community inspired but led by a schools service whose solitary focus is to make cuts on the front line and save their	As stated in the One Powys Plan, the authority is committed to ensuring that 'all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential'. The authority's view is that the named receiving school can provide high quality education to the children currently attending Nantmel C. in W. School.

	own bacon of being cast into special measures.	<p>The Proposal is aligned with the requirements of the Welsh Government’s School Organisation Code, which states that ‘Relevant bodies should place the interests of learners above all others. With reference to the key questions of the Office of Her Majesty’s Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales (Estyn), they should give paramount importance to the likely impact of the proposals on the quality of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • outcomes (standards and wellbeing); • provision (learning experiences, teaching, care, support and guidance, and learning environment); and • leadership and management (leadership, improving quality, partnership working and resource management)’. <p>The aim of this proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure, and whilst a proposal’s impact on the community is one of a number of considerations, ultimately economic and social factors are non-educational issues.</p>
5.142	The Schools Service have ensured that Nantmel has not been judged equitably to determine a case.	<p>This statement is untrue. The process that has been carried out in respect of Nantmel C. in W. School has been in-line with the requirements of the School Transformation Policy (2014) and the School Organisation Code. All issues raised during the consultation period were taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to the proposal. All Objections received will be taken into consideration by the Cabinet when making a final decision on this proposal.</p>
5.143	It doesn’t seem balanced to close a school, destroy a community and risk educational standards at several schools and the wellbeing of our children for the sake of satisfying performance targets.	<p>As stated in the One Powys Plan, the authority is committed to ensuring that ‘all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential’.</p> <p>The Proposal is aligned with the requirements of the Welsh Government’s School Organisation Code, which states that ‘Relevant bodies should place the interests of learners above all others. With reference to the key questions of the Office of Her Majesty’s Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales (Estyn), they should give paramount importance to the likely impact of the proposals on the quality of:</p>

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • outcomes (standards and wellbeing); • provision (learning experiences, teaching, care, support and guidance, and learning environment); and • leadership and management (leadership, improving quality, partnership working and resource management)'. <p>The aim of this proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure, and whilst a proposal's impact on the community is one of a number of considerations, ultimately economic and social factors are non-educational issues. The authority's view is that the named receiving school can provide high quality education to the children currently attending Nantmel C. in W. School.</p>
5.144	These are wholly destructive acts for pathetic gains.	The authority does not agree with this comment. The aim of this proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
5.145	Urge the Cabinet to vote for positive change and to do the job we elect you to fulfil, to provide good quality, diverse education in an inspirational rural area.	<p>As stated in the One Powys Plan, the authority is committed to ensuring that 'all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential'. The authority's view is that the named receiving school can provide high quality education to the children currently attending Nantmel C. in W. School.</p> <p>The Proposal is aligned with the requirements of the Welsh Government's School Organisation Code, which states that 'Relevant bodies should place the interests of learners above all others. With reference to the key questions of the Office of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales (Estyn), they should give paramount importance to the likely impact of the proposals on the quality of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • outcomes (standards and wellbeing); • provision (learning experiences, teaching, care, support and guidance, and learning environment); and • leadership and management (leadership, improving quality, partnership working and resource management)'. <p>The aim of this proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.</p>

Objection 6		
6.1	This proposal fails to offer the best outcome for our children	<p>The authority is committed to ensuring that ‘all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential’. The authority’s view is that the named receiving school can provide high quality education to the children currently attending Nantmel C. in W. School.</p> <p>The Proposal is aligned with the requirements of the Welsh Government’s School Organisation Code, which states that ‘Relevant bodies should place the interests of learners above all others. With reference to the key questions of the Office of Her Majesty’s Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales (Estyn), they should give paramount importance to the likely impact of the proposals on the quality of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • outcomes (standards and wellbeing); • provision (learning experiences, teaching, care, support and guidance, and learning environment); and • leadership and management (leadership, improving quality, partnership working and resource management)’.
6.2	Our children, community and families have been failed on the right to the doctrine of legitimate expectation, the right to be treated fairly and we believe that the ‘Gunning principles of Consultation’ have not been followed.	The consultation process was carried out in accordance with the requirements of the School Organisation Code, which takes full account of the Gunning Principles.
6.3	Adequate time, which is a primary principle, has been reduced to the irreducible minimum at the busiest time in the rural community calendar for the perceivable primary purpose of predetermining an outcome.	The statutory process has been carried out in-line with the timescales outlined within the School Organisation Code and Cabinet meetings have been arranged and papers have been published in-line with the requirements of sections 100A and 100B of the Local Government Act (1972).

6.4	Local members and councillors from opposing parties voiced their concerns over conscientious consideration – the unrealistic timeframe of digesting 230 pages of documentation is astonishing.	The statutory process has been carried out in-line with the timescales outlined within the School Organisation Code and Cabinet meetings have been arranged in-line with the requirements of sections 100A and 100B of the Local Government Act (1972).
6.5	The principle of intelligent consideration has been duly ignored in the consultation responses and this is reiterated by Estyn's response.	The authority does not agree with this statement. The consultation process was carried out in-line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code. All issues raised by Estyn in their consultation response were addressed in the consultation report in respect of this proposal.
6.6	We feel let down by the Local Authority's approach.	The consultation process was carried out in accordance with the requirements of the School Organisation Code.
6.7	The Council has failed to evidence any quantitative or real qualitative data of the effects of children's attainment levels when moving schools during a school year	There is no evidence to suggest that school closures have any detrimental effect on pupil outcomes or wellbeing during the academic year. The most recent and relevant example is the closure of 10 primary school and the opening of 4 new primary schools in the Ystradgynlais area and the opening. The pupils of Ysgol Cwmtwrch and Ysgol Gymraeg Ynysgedwyn moved into their new school in January, which was during the school year, however there is no evidence that this had a negative impact on pupil attainment or well-being.
6.8	Concerns were raised in the consultation period but there were no evidenced responses from the authority – individual child outcomes were not evidenced even from the repetitive dissimilar example of Maesydderwen	It is not appropriate to publically evidence individual pupil outcomes. However, there is no evidence to suggest that there would be a negative impact on pupils' standards or wellbeing.
6.9	Estyn reiterates the point – 'the local authority does not consider sufficient evidence'	The information provided in the consultation document is in line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code.
6.10	Foundation Phase pupils at Nantmel all reached the expected level or were above –	The transition of pupils will ensure that transfer of all relevant information on pupil achievement, attainment and standards of wellbeing. These arrangement would

	the authority has failed to identify and evidence how they will support these children to maintain these levels during a disrupted school year	include visits to receiving schools by pupils and regular staff meetings to ensure that any necessary support is in place before the transfer of pupils. The progress of all pupils is monitored regularly by the Challenge Advisers.
6.11	Call on officers of the authority to compare and publish for the purpose of further Scrutiny for Councillors and members of the public the latest National Test Results in the foundation phase between Nantmel and Rhayader School	The intention and purpose of the National Tests in Literacy and Numeracy is that they are used as diagnostic tools by schools and not as a means of judging and comparing pupil performance within and between schools.
6.12	The authority fails to respond adequately to the consultees concerns on the emotional and mental wellbeing of Nantmel children	The authority has acknowledged that any school reorganisation proposal creates a period of uncertainty for the pupils affected. Should the school close, the receiving school or any other school pupils might wish to transfer to would provide support to pupils to aid their transition. Whilst this was not specifically noted in the consultation document itself, this issue was raised extensively during the consultation process as being a concern for parents, and this was included in the consultation report that was considered by Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to this proposal.
6.13	No specific measures or resourcing has been offered to ensure the children will be supported – this should be addressed by Officers at the authority and discussed by Cabinet.	The transition of pupils will ensure that transfer of all relevant information on pupil achievement, attainment and standards of wellbeing. These arrangements would include visits to receiving schools by pupils and regular staff meetings to ensure that any necessary support is in place before the transfer of pupils. The progress of all pupils is monitored regularly by the Challenge Advisers.
6.14	Closing the school swiftly does not address a child's emotional need.	The process in respect of the proposal to close Nantmel C. in W. School has been carried out in line with the timescales set out in the School Organisation Code. The authority acknowledges that any school reorganisation proposal creates a period of uncertainty for pupils. Should the school close, the receiving school or any other school pupils might wish to transfer to would provide support to pupils to aid their transition, and this would include ensuring that their needs are met. The authority's view is that it is better to conclude these statutory processes as swiftly as possible in order to minimise the period of uncertainty for the pupils involved.

6.15	The consultation report has failed to ‘give paramount importance to the likely impact of the proposals on the quality of outcomes (standards and wellbeing)’, as recognised by Estyn and other consultees.	<p>All issues raised by Estyn in their consultation response were addressed in the consultation report in respect of this proposal.</p> <p>As stated in the One Powys Plan, ‘we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.’ The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.</p> <p>The authority is committed to ensuring that ‘all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential’, and the authority’s view is that the named receiving school can provide high quality education to the children currently attending Nantmel C. in W. School.</p>
6.16	Learners at Nantmel feel understood and are well known by their teachers, which encourage self esteem and confidence ensuring that they are ready to learn	The authority notes this comment. However, our expectation would be that all learners would be understood and well known by their teachers, therefore there is no reason to believe that this would not be the case in other schools the pupils may transfer to. All schools would be expected to encourage pupils’ self-esteem and confidence and to ensure that pupils are ready to learn.
6.17	Cabinet members have not guaranteed that the individual needs of pupils and their outcomes will be maintained or improved upon by moving them to another school.	The transition of pupils will ensure that transfer of all relevant information on pupil achievement, attainment and standards of wellbeing. These arrangement would include visits to receiving schools by pupils and regular staff meetings to ensure that any necessary support is in place before the transfer of pupils. The progress of all pupils is monitored regularly by the Challenge Advisers.
6.18	Every child is different.	The authority accepts that every child is different. All schools are expected to treat children as individuals and to ensure that their individual needs are met. The authority has no reason to believe that this would not be the case at the named receiving school or any other school the pupils may choose to attend.
6.19	The Community Impact Assessment is incomplete as the authority has not attempted to ascertain what would happen to the building on dissolution of the School – therefore the likely impact on the community	As the school is owned by the Church, the Church would decide what would happen to the school building should Nantmel C. in W. School close. The authority will enter into discussions with the Church in relation to future use of the school building if necessary depending on the decision made by Cabinet on the way forward in respect of Nantmel C. in W. School.

	has not been considered or assessed – this should have been sought prior to a decision	The community impact assessment acknowledged that closure of the school would have an impact on the community, and referred to the lack of alternative community facilities in the local area. However, the aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, economic and social factors are non-educational issues.
6.20	Authority has contravened section 1.4 of the School Organisation Code – ‘In order to fulfil these duties, local authorities must ensure that they plan thoroughly and engage fully with relevant partners, including the appropriate religious bodies for schools serving their area which have a designated religious character’	<p>The authority did engage with the Church in Wales throughout the SORP process which preceded the consultation process, and has notified the Church in Wales of developments throughout the process. Issues raised by the Church were included in the Consultation Report in respect of this proposal.</p> <p>As stated in the consultation document, the diocesan authority was given 28 days to provide comments on the proposal prior to Cabinet making a decision on whether or not to commence consultation, in line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code. However, the diocesan authority did not wish to provide comments prior to the commencement of consultation.</p>
6.21	Reference to community links between local enterprise, the school, the church and the wider community	<p>The authority has identified links between the school and other organisations within the community. A number of issues were raised during the consultation period which referred to these links and the possible impact closure of Nantmel C. in W. School could have on the community. These were taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed, along with an updated Community Impact Assessment.</p> <p>The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, economic and social factors are non-educational issues.</p>
6.22	Global guests at the Sharing Shakespeare week at the Willow theatre were amazed at the strong sense of community within Nantmel and St Marks Church. The school is a coherent part of this	The authority notes this comment. The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, economic and social factors are non-educational issues.

6.23	Cabinet fail to acknowledge the school's role in the community, in favour of their own personal experiences – they are failing to be objective	The authority has acknowledged that closure of the school would have an impact on the community. However pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are small and are not expected to increase in the next few years. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.' The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, economic and social factors are non-educational issues.
6.24	Strict financial equality across learners will lead to disparity and discrimination across our communities	The authority recognises that there are children who need more in terms of resourcing to support their learning, and this is accounted for in the ALN delegated budget as well as access to the graduated response to need e.g. top up funding. The ALN budget currently provided to Nantmel C. in W. School is small due to the school's size and demography, the ALN budget in the alternative schools is significantly larger.
6.25	Powys states that 'the council acknowledges that in a rural county as diverse as Powys there is no one size fits all approach to school organisation', however the Council are not prepared to back this claim with adequate resource.	It is true that the council acknowledges that in a county such as Powys there is no one size fits all approach to school organisation, however as stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.' Pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are small and are not expected to increase in the next few years. The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
6.26	The saving of £54k is meagre and disproportionate to the detriment of the community, family's choice of education and loss of jobs.	The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, economic and social factors, such as detriment to the community and loss of jobs, are non-educational issues. Whilst the authority has named a receiving school as part of this proposal, should Nantmel C. in W. School close, parents could apply for a place in any other school, therefore parents would still have freedom of choice about what type of school they wished their children to go to.
6.27	The saving fails to include redundancy payments and does not consider associated consultation costs.	It is true that the estimated savings do not include redundancy payments, and this was made clear in the consultation document. Redundancy costs are a one-off cost. In relation to associated consultation costs, the authority is required to go through a


		<p>statutory consultation process in accordance with the School Organisation Code in respect of any proposal to close a school. This is part of the work of the authority's School Modernisation Team and other officers, and is part of the role of Cabinet members, therefore there is no additional cost to the authority. There was a cost of £936 for the consultants who facilitated the public meeting, as well as a cost of £50 for the hire of translation equipment.</p>
6.28	<p>The authority's HR department has the ability to produce a workforce impact assessment but has not done so, not allowing for intelligent consideration.</p>	<p>The proposal's impact on staff was considered in the Consultation Document in-line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code. In addition, a separate consultation meeting with staff was held during the consultation period, to give staff the opportunity to raise any issues relating to the proposal's impact on them. The issues raised relating to impact on staff were included in the consultation report.</p>
6.29	<p>The report fails to evidence their statement that 'pupil numbers have been low for a number of years'</p>	<p>Information about pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School over the last 5 years was provided in the consultation document in respect of this proposal. This information shows that pupil numbers have been below 50 since 2011.</p>
6.30	<p>The report cherry picks data and it is requested that a long term analysis of several small schools is completed to illustrate pupil population trends as an effective way to analyse pupil numbers accurately for effective decision making by Councillors and to demonstrate that this has been done.</p>	<p>The consultation document provided data in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School and other schools in the local area which pupils may transfer to should the school close. It is not true that data is 'cherry picked' – the data provided is in line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code.</p>
6.31	<p>The authority has recognised that the surplus capacity calculation for Nantmel can be represented as less, reducing surplus capacity.</p>	<p>The capacity of a school is calculated in accordance with the Measuring Capacity of Schools in Wales (MCSW) regulations and is based on the school's use of its current physical facilities. The measurement is undertaken by officers of the authority and checked and confirmed with headteachers and members of the governing body.</p> <p>The authority recognises that if one of the spaces included in the calculation was identified as a non-teaching space the capacity of the school would be reduced.</p>
6.32	<p>A classroom should have been considered as an ancillary base in the absence of a school</p>	<p>The capacity of a school is calculated in accordance with the Measuring Capacity of Schools in Wales (MCSW) regulations and is based on the school's use of its current</p>

	<p>hall – based on this the school would have been considered full to capacity in 2010, however this was not scrutinised by Cabinet even though it had been used by SORP as a determining factor.</p>	<p>physical facilities. The measurement is undertaken by officers of the authority and checked and confirmed with headteachers and members of the governing body.</p> <p>The authority recognises that if one of the spaces included in the calculation was identified as a non-teaching space the capacity of the school would be reduced.</p> <p>Surplus capacity was only one of the criteria outlined in the School Transformation Policy (2014) met by the school.</p>
6.33	<p>Issues should be demonstrably discussed in meetings to illustrate effective decision making has taken place.</p>	<p>This matter was fully debated in the Cabinet meeting held on the 23rd June 2016 when it was the only substantive issue on the agenda.</p>
6.34	<p>Kirsty Williams has committed to ‘Reduce infant class sizes so they contain no more than 25 pupils’. Closure of schools means that local schools will not have the capacity to take the children of Nantmel as the receiving school has class sizes of 35.</p>	<p>The authority notes this comment, however at the current time, no directive has been issued in relation to reducing infant class sizes so that they contain no more than 25 pupils. The capacity of local schools will be taken into consideration when making a final decision in respect of this proposal, and when determining how to proceed in relation to proposals affecting other schools in the local area.</p>
6.35	<p>On the cusp of a Rural Schools policy, governors object to the lack of pre-emptive strategic planning from the authority.</p>	<p>There is currently no Rural Schools policy in operation. As stated in the One Powys Plan, ‘we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.’ The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.</p>
6.36	<p>The sustainability of closing all rural schools in Powys will result in no capacity at other schools if there was an upward turn in the birth rate, or a population shift.</p>	<p>The authority notes this comment, however based on the latest information available, pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are not expected to increase in the coming years.</p>
6.37	<p>An aging population in Powys will become a self-fulfilling prophecy fuelled by policy that fails to support rural communities.</p>	<p>As stated in the One Powys Plan, ‘we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.’ The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, economic and social factors are</p>

		non-educational issues.
6.38	The reasons for discounting alternative options are not clear enough and the reasons why have not been evidenced for further discussion.	The authority is satisfied that appropriate consideration has been given to alternative options in respect of this proposal.
6.39	The spirit of consultation has not been entered into and the bare minimum has been documented in the consultation report.	<p>The consultation process has been carried out in-line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code. In respect of the consultation report, the Code states that:</p> <p>'Within 13 weeks of the end of the period allowed for responses (and in any event prior to publication of the proposals), the proposer must publish a consultation report:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Summarising each of the issues raised by consultees; • Responding to these by means of clarification, amendment to the proposal or rejection of the concerns, with supporting reasons; and • Setting out Estyn's view (as provided in its consultation response) of the overall merits of the proposal.' <p>The authority is satisfied that the consultation report in respect of this proposal met the requirements of the Code.</p>
6.40	Closure of schools on an individual basis rather than at a strategic level across the county has discouraged options of collaborative working and diminished the number of options available.	A number of possible options were considered by the SORP when determining the draft recommendation in respect of Nantmel C. in W. School, however these were not considered to be a suitable way forward. Pupil numbers at the school are small, and are not expected to increase in the coming years. The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
6.41	The SORP's recommendations are based on a narrow set of criteria, that has been set aside in subsequent policies where it has not been considered of primary importance.	Nantmel C. in W. School was identified for review based on the criteria outlined in the authority's School Transformation Policy (2014).

6.42	Shared headship and collaborative working was the preferred option by the governing body and this has not been facilitated as an ongoing option.	This option was taken into consideration by the SORP when determining the draft recommendation in respect of Nantmel C. in W. School, however this was not considered to be a suitable way forward.
6.43	The authority has not facilitated Nantmel School exploring options of federation with schools other than Rhayader – the authority only seeks to facilitate when it can determine the outcome.	A number of possible options were considered by the SORP when determining the draft recommendation in respect of Nantmel C. in W. School, however these were not considered to be a suitable way forward. Pupil numbers at the school are small, and are not expected to increase in the coming years. The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
6.44	Wales Audit Office in their Annual Improvement Report 2016 have recommended that the local authority needs to do more to ensure that they ‘improve the attractiveness of education leadership roles’. Should be recognised by Cabinet members that closure of rural schools does not solve a leadership issue that appears to stem from the Schools Service.	Recruitment of headteachers is a nationwide problem, and is a particular issue in rural authorities. The local authority works with governing bodies to identify alternative solutions to address the challenge.
6.45	Authority has not responded to consultees concerns of the accuracy of building reports that the SORP made recommendations for closure upon – the receiving school illustrates a lower standard for sustainability.	<p>One of the criteria for reviewing a school as stated in the authority’s School Transformation Policy (2014) is as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The overall building condition is categorised as category D or C based on the Welsh Government’s assessment of building condition. <p>Further to this, the Welsh Government’s School Organisation Code requires authorities to provide the following information in consultation documents:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Information about the quality of accommodation at all existing schools likely to be affected by the proposals including reference to the condition category of the school as identified by the 21st Century Schools Survey. <p>Information about the building condition of Nantmel C. in W. School, the named</p>

		receiving school and other schools in the local area was provided in the Consultation Document. It is true that the Sustainability rating is lower for Rhayader C. in W. School compared with Nantmel C. in W. School, however the overall Condition rating is higher.
6.46	Cabinet makes decisions on the SORP recommendation that is based on flawed evidence.	The authority does not agree that the evidence presented to Cabinet is flawed. The information that has been presented throughout the process has been the latest verified information available at the time.
6.47	Pleased that the authority agrees with us that we can become a 'B' standard but this has not been discussed as a way forward to prevent closure	Nantmel C. in W. School met a number of the criteria outlined in the Schools Transformation Policy (2014). Should the school building be improved in order to meet the requirements for condition B, the school would continue to meet a number of other criteria.
6.48	Point 10.5 – 'work would not address the suitability issues at the school' – this is the first that we have been made aware of this and we require further information.	The suitability assessment would include the requirement to meet the relevant building bulletin. The school does not have a main hall, and without the provision of such a facility, could not have an assessment as category B or better.
6.49	Consultation report claims that a full health and safety report has been completed in regard to the receiving school access however this has not been published as part of the consultation report.	<p>Since the consultation meeting, a review of the car parking situation at Rhayader C.in W.School has been carried out, any remedial work required will be risk assessed and scored in accordance with the Authority's major improvements capital programme and included in the relevant programme in accordance to the score given.</p> <p>The pupils who live within the catchment area of Nantmel and more than two miles from the named receiving school will be provided with county funded home to school transport and therefore the number of additional vehicles on the site at the start and end of day will not be significant.</p> <p>Notes of the Health and Safety Officer's review are provided below:</p>

		 Rhayader parking review.pdf
6.50	At the public consultation meeting at Nantmel, County Councillor outlined that a risk assessment of Rhayader school access would take place, this information needs to be evidenced and disseminated to stakeholders for transparent effective decision making.	Since the consultation meeting, a review of the car parking situation at Rhayader C. in W. School has been carried out, any remedial work required will be risk assessed and scored in accordance with the Authority's major improvements capital programme and included in the relevant programme in accordance to the score given. The pupils who live within the catchment area of Nantmel and more than two miles from the named receiving school will be provided with county funded home to school transport and therefore the number of additional vehicles on the site at the start and end of day will not be significant. Notes of the Health and Safety Officer's review is provided below:

Review of Access arrangements at Rhayader C In W School

Situation

Rhayader C in W School is located on the edge of a residential area within Rhayader, off Brintinon Lane. The school has a drive, which leads to two separate areas. One is to a small car park, the other to the front of the school and additional parking area. Visitors including parents mainly use the small car park; staff mainly use the lower car park. Adjacent to the parking the front of the school is a traffic island that the school transport uses; there is also some parking in this area. There are approximately 188 pupils in the school as at January 2018. For pedestrians, a separate walkway comes out onto the lower drive near the school.

A plan of the school site is on the last page

Hazards

Possible conflict between pedestrians and vehicles
Tripping because of the condition of the surface
Conflict between vehicles because of width of lane
Conflict between vehicles because of restricted car park

Persons at Risk

Pupils, staff and visitors to the school
Children, staff and visitors to the nursery

Existing Control Measures

Separate route for pedestrians (there are some limitations to this see below)
School sends reminders to parents regarding use of car park
Staff park to the front of the school to reduce vehicles movements during pupil arrival and departure times

Are hazards controlled? No

Further Information and Measures

The current parking facilities are inadequate for the number of pupils at the school. In addition, there is parking taken up by the nursery, which is located on the school site.

The small car park is of an irregular shape, it isn't marked up and the surface is in poor condition. Because of the irregular shape, if the car park were resurfaced and marked up, it would result in fewer spaces being available.

There is a public car park within ½ mile of the school, however, this is not used, possibly due to its location resulting in a walk uphill to the school.

6.51	Haste in the way the consultation has progressed since the extraordinary meeting of the 16 th June suggests that the decision was predetermined.	The decision in respect of Nantmel C. in W. School was not predetermined.
6.52	Spirit of consultation has not been entered into and the authority has participated and produced only the irreducible minimum necessary to comply with the School Organisation Code.	The process in respect of Nantmel C. in W. School has been carried out in-line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code.
6.53	Consultation report was released less than 48 hours after the extraordinary meeting without Local Members comments as he was not asked prior to publication.	The Local Member was invited to provide comments for inclusion in the Cabinet report before it was published, and was advised that his comments could be added to the report should he wish to provide comments after it was published. However he declined this invitation – a statement to this effect received from him was included in the Cabinet Report.
6.54	Cabinet decision meeting only a week after the extraordinary council meeting ensured that 3 days notice was subscribed to as per Council policy, however many parents did not receive their hard copies of the consultation report prior to the decision meeting as time did not permit.	<p>The School Organisation Code states the following in relation to publication of the consultation report:</p> <p>‘The consultation report must be published electronically, either on the proposer’s website or if one is not available, on the relevant local authority’s website. In addition, hard copies must be available on request. This must take place before any proposal is published.</p> <p>The following must be advised of the availability of the consultation report:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pupils, parents (and where possible prospective parents) carers and guardians, and staff members of schools which are subject to the proposals....’ <p>The authority is satisfied that these requirements were met.</p>
6.55	Haste was extended to the statutory notice being released the next day after the decision	It is true that the authority needed to publish the statutory notice in time to allow 15 schools days before the end of term.

	meeting, vital for the council to achieve 15 school days being included in the objection period.	The authority acknowledges that any school reorganisation proposal creates a period of uncertainty for pupils. As stated in the Consultation Report in respect of this proposal, the authority is keen to conclude this process as swiftly as possible in order to minimise the period of uncertainty, therefore the authority was keen to publish the Notice before the end of the school term, so that the proposal could proceed in accordance with the original timescale.
6.56	Statement on Council website on the day of the decision meeting alludes to predetermination 'A small Powys primary school will close at the end of the year' – final decision actually takes place in the objection meeting that has not yet taken place – this is not conveyed in the news story	The decision in respect of Nantmel C. in W. School has not been predetermined. At the Cabinet meeting held on the 23 rd June, Cabinet agreed to publish a formal proposal to close the school. We accept that the press release was not clear about the procedure for submitting Objections to the proposal, however all stakeholders were informed of the publication of the statutory notice in accordance with the School Organisation Code. All objections received during the objection period will be taken into consideration by Cabinet when make a final decision in respect of Nantmel C. in W. School.
6.57	The Cabinet committee and Scrutiny Chair have rescinded on a decision made for Scrutiny Committee to scrutinize the consultation report before it was considered by Cabinet – a commitment to accountability and effective decision making has been secondary to a closure schedule that alludes to predetermination	As stated in the minutes of the Cabinet meeting held on the 23 rd June 2016: 'The Leader referred to correspondence he had received questioning his right to call the meeting and referring to the minutes of the Cabinet meeting on 15 December 2015 when the Chair of the People Scrutiny Committee had asked for the Committee to have sight of the results of consultation before the report came back to Cabinet. He advised that the Chair of the Scrutiny Committee had been informed of the meeting and that he had replied to say that he was satisfied that the report was in accordance with the Council's policies and he was therefore content for the Cabinet meeting to proceed. The Leader noted that it was a matter for the Chair of the Scrutiny Committee whether or not to call a meeting of the Committee. The Monitoring Officer confirmed that this was the case.'
6.58	A complaint has been lodged with the Council for maladministration and with the ombudsman concerning Members code of conduct, we encourage the authority to seek	The authority notes this comment. These complaints will be addressed in line with the relevant procedure.

	resolution prior to continuing with the proposal of closure.	
6.59	Believed that the Extraordinary meeting of the 16 th June was incorrectly advised upon altering the outcome of the meeting with unjust consequences for Nantmel School – a complaint has been lodged with the Council and this should be resolved prior and scrutinized in the objection meeting.	The authority notes this comment. The complaint will be addressed in line with the relevant procedure.
6.60	Council meeting on 13 th July – successful motion to include primary schools to include full council contribution which now applies to Llanbister and Llanfihangel Rhydithon, but this fails to redress the injustice to Nantmel and the discrimination against our community and children. Cllr Wynne Jones has specified that this will be dealt with in the objection period, and the governors want to ensure this is actioned	At the Council meeting held on the 13 th July, no commitment was made that full council would discuss the proposal in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School. It was stated that there would be an opportunity for stakeholders to submit Objections as part of the statutory process, which would be taken into consideration by Cabinet when making a final decision, and that this is in-line with the process carried out in relation to Talgarth C.P. School and Bronllys C.P. School, as well as the Welsh-medium stream at Ysgol Dolafon.
6.61	Meeting of the 13 th July has cast doubt on the accuracy of the electronic voting system – this requires resolution before proceeding	The electronic voting system was fully tested on the 13 th July 2016 and was found to be in perfect working order.
6.62	Local member was only permitted to speak for 5 minutes at the decision meeting illustrating a disregard for those speaking out for Nantmel School	The 5 minute limit on speeches at Cabinet meetings was approved by full Council on 20 th April 2016 as one of a number of amendments to the Constitution.
6.63	Members from the Conservative and Liberal Democrat groups were ignored when raising the issue of Scrutiny Committee and the legitimacy of the meeting subsequent to the	The Cabinet meeting held on the 23 rd June 2016 was convened in-line with the requirements of the Local Government Act (1972). As stated in the minutes of the meeting, 'The Leader referred to correspondence he

	extraordinary meeting of the 16 th June.	<p>had received questioning his right to call the meeting and referring to the minutes of the Cabinet meeting on 15 December 2015 when the Chair of the People Scrutiny Committee had asked for the Committee to have sight of the results of consultation before the report came back to Cabinet. He advised that the Chair of the Scrutiny Committee had been informed of the meeting and that he had replied to say that he was satisfied that the report was in accordance with the Council's policies and he was therefore content for the Cabinet meeting to proceed. The Leader noted that it was a matter for the Chair of the Scrutiny Committee whether or not to call a meeting of the Committee. The Monitoring Officer confirmed that this was the case.'</p> <p>The leaders of the Conservative and Liberal Democrat groups were given the opportunity to comment on the recommendation in line with the usual protocol.</p>
6.64	Debate and scrutiny by Cabinet failed to evolve from the first initial meeting through to the decision meeting	The authority notes this comment.
6.65	Despite the standard rhetoric from every Cabinet member saying that they had read the report, their depth of knowledge was illustrated to be exceedingly limited and they failed to take on board the concerns of stakeholders	As stated in the minutes of the Cabinet meeting held on the 23 rd June 2016: 'Each Cabinet member confirmed that they had read the report and appendices.'
Objection 7		
7.1	Moved here from a bigger town where there are no schools with less than 30 students per class – never met a child at these schools that actually enjoyed being at school apart from the odd one or two.	The authority acknowledges that some pupils might be happier in a small class / school situation, however all school are expected to ensure that pupils are happy in their learning environment. Should Nantmel C. in W. School close, the receiving school would be expected to provide full support to pupils to aid their transition. Class sizes at Nantmel C. in W. School are very small, and pupil numbers at the school are not expected to increase in the coming years. The aim of this proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.

7.2	I was going to home educate my children until a friend introduced us to a rural school that was full of happy smiley children that had the confidence to come and talk to an adult	The authority notes this comment. It is the duty of parents to ensure their children receive an appropriate education and parents can decide to do this through home educating their children if they wish. By doing so the parents take responsibility for their education and the local authority has no further direct role. The authority would expect pupils at all schools to be happy and confident, and has no reason to believe that this would not be the case should they attend a different school.
7.3	Was shocked and impressed to see teachers enjoying being with the children and that the children felt the same towards them.	The authority notes this comment, however the same would be expected of all teachers, regardless of the school / class size.
7.4	Rural schools are so important to the parents who are like family to each other and offer support to each other that you would not expect on the school gates of bigger schools.	The authority notes this comment. However, pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are small and are not expected to increase in the coming years. The aim of this proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, economic and social factors are non-educational issues.
7.5	Rural Welsh schools are something extraordinary that Wales should celebrate and recognise as places that people in bigger cities and towns can only dream about.	The authority notes this comment, however pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are small and are not expected to increase in the coming years. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity'. The aim of this proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
7.6	I would travel as far as I had to to get my children into a rural school.	The authority notes this comment. Whilst the authority has named a receiving school as part of the proposal to close Nantmel C. in W. School, parents could apply for a place at any other school should Nantmel C. in W. School close, therefore parents would still have freedom of choice about what type of school they wished their children to go to.
7.7	If rural schools are closed, I will try my hardest to keep my children away from school.	The authority notes this comment. It is the duty of parents to ensure their children receive an appropriate education and parents can decide to do this through home educating their children if they wish. By doing so the parents take responsibility for their education and the local authority has no further direct role.

Objection 8		
8.1	The Council has acted with undue haste in the process of closing the school following the extraordinary meeting of 16 th June 2016	The process in respect of Nantmel C. in W. School has been carried out in line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code. The arrangements for the Cabinet meeting held on the 23 rd June 2016 were made in accordance with the requirements of the Local Government Act 1972.
8.2	The Council have rushed through the process of closure with undue haste in a way that blatantly demonstrates a pre-determined outcome to close the school	The process in respect of Nantmel C. in W. School has been carried out in line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code. The arrangements for the Cabinet meeting held on the 23 rd June 2016 were made in accordance with the requirements of the Local Government Act 1972. There is no pre-determined outcome to close Nantmel C. in W. School. All objections received during the statutory objection period will be taken into consideration by Cabinet when making a final decision on how to proceed in relation to the school.
8.3	Consultation report was released less than 48 hours after the extraordinary meeting	It is true that the consultation report and papers for the Cabinet meeting to be held on the 23 rd June were released soon after the extraordinary meeting. The arrangements for the meeting were made in accordance with the requirements of the Local Government Act 1972.
8.4	23 rd June – Cabinet members voted to close the school. I question how seriously they properly read and digested the content of the consultation report in such a short period of time.	The arrangements for the Cabinet meeting held on the 23 rd June 2016 were made in accordance with the requirements of the Local Government Act 1972. As stated in the minutes of the Cabinet meeting held on the 23 rd June 2016: 'Each Cabinet member confirmed that they had read the report and appendices.'
8.5	The Council failed in its obligations to have the consultation report viewed by the Scrutiny Panel – the Cabinet, having the knowledge that the Scrutiny Panel has not viewed the consultation report still deliberately chose to carry on with the procedure and vote on the closure of Nantmel School	As stated in the minutes of the Cabinet meeting held on the 23 rd June 2016: 'The Leader referred to correspondence he had received questioning his right to call the meeting and referring to the minutes of the Cabinet meeting on 15 December 2015 when the Chair of the People Scrutiny Committee had asked for the Committee to have sight of the results of consultation before the report came back to Cabinet. He advised that the Chair of the Scrutiny Committee had been informed of the

		meeting and that he had replied to say that he was satisfied that the report was in accordance with the Council's policies and he was therefore content for the Cabinet meeting to proceed. The Leader noted that it was a matter for the Chair of the Scrutiny Committee whether or not to call a meeting of the Committee. The Monitoring Officer confirmed that this was the case.'
8.6	24 th June – the day after the Cabinet meeting – notice was served to close Nantmel School – evident that the rush was so that the minimum requirement of 15 school days could be observed prior to the summer break in order to meet the closure date of 31 st December 2016.	<p>It is true that the authority needed to publish the statutory notice in time to allow 15 schools days before the end of term.</p> <p>The authority acknowledges that any school reorganisation proposal creates a period of uncertainty for pupils. As stated in the Consultation Report in respect of this proposal, the authority is keen to conclude this process as swiftly as possible in order to minimise the period of uncertainty, therefore the authority was keen to publish the Notice before the end of the school term, so that the proposal could proceed in accordance with the original timescale.</p>
8.7	At no stage in the process have the Council taken the stance of even pretending to be on the side of the school and local community over this issue	The authority is committed to ensuring that 'all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential.' As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.' The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, economic and social factors are non-educational issues.
8.8	The Council has taken a defensive attitude to closure of the school – this is a typical stance of someone or some organisation that has a desired outcome and knows it will face objections	It is untrue that the authority has taken a defensive attitude or that the authority has a desired outcome in respect of this proposal. Full consultation on the proposal to close Nantmel C. in W. School was carried out in accordance with the requirements of the School Organisation Code.
8.9	The Council has failed to provide clear information on who owns and has an interest in the school buildings. The decision to close the school has gone ahead without confirmed knowledge as to ownership – how can an informed decision be made without this	<p>The authority disagrees with this comment. The following information is provided on page 12 of the Consultation Document:</p> <p>'The land and buildings currently occupied by Nantmel C. in W. School are owned by the Church in Wales, and the playing field is leased by the County Council. If the school were to close, the building would remain in the ownership of the Church in</p>

	knowledge?	Wales, and the lease in respect of the playing field would be surrendered.'
8.10	The Council hasn't bothered to find out and inform the community what will happen to the building when the school is closed.	As the school is owned by the Church, the Church would decide what would happen to the school building should Nantmel C. in W. School close. The authority will enter into discussions with the Church in relation to future use of the school building if necessary depending on the decision made by Cabinet on the way forward in respect of Nantmel C. in W. School.
8.11	The Council consistently produced inaccurate data, particularly surrounding the financial situation during the consultation phase	The authority does not agree with this statement. The information provided in the consultation document was the latest verified data available at the time, along with estimated savings based on the most up-to-date information available. These were checked again prior to the consultation report being considered by Cabinet on the 23 rd and were revised to £54,000.
8.12	During the Cabinet meeting, Cabinet members were very negative, showing no real concern or support to the local community	It is the Cabinet's duty to consider the consultation report and associated impact assessments in respect of any school reorganisation process. In this case, Cabinet gave due regard to these documents, however they decided to proceed with the proposal to close Nantmel C. in W. School.
8.13	Comments by Cabinet members claiming that communities survive after school closures is not a satisfactory answer to the concerns we have in our community which is unique and cannot be properly compared to other communities elsewhere	Every Cabinet member has the right to respond to any item of business in any way he or she chooses.
8.14	Council's own statement 'Our vision is a council that places working with our communities at the heart of its response' and 'Stronger Communities in the green heart of Wales' is being ignored.	It is true that the council's vision is 'Stronger Communities in the Green Heart of Wales'. However, one of the council's priorities, as outlined in the One Powys Plan, is 'Transforming Learning and Skills'. Within this priority, the Plan states that 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity'.
8.15	Cabinet members only visited Nantmel School when shamed into doing so.	It is not usual practice for all Cabinet members to visit schools as part of school reorganisation procedures. Following a request in relation to the recent consultations affecting three small schools in Radnorshire, Cabinet members agreed to visit the

		three schools.
8.16	Object to comment by one Cabinet member that the community argument doesn't hold because some of the families attending the school are from outside Nantmel parish	The authority is committed to ensuring that 'all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential.' As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.' The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, economic and social factors are non-educational issues.
8.17	The Council are allowing decisions to be made based on the misguided beliefs and judgements of Cabinet members.	Every Cabinet member has the right to respond to any item of business in any way he or she chooses.
8.18	The Council have systematically caused a managed decline of Nantmel School by allowing a belief that the school is under threat of closure to exist with the result that parents will register their children in a school which they perceive as having a safe, long term future.	As stated in the consultation document, there were 36 pupils at Nantmel C. in W. School in January 2011, and pupil numbers have decreased since then. The pupil projections for Nantmel C. in W. School that were considered before this process started did not suggest any significant increase in pupil numbers. The authority notes that any school reorganisation process will lead to a period of uncertainty for those affected, however no formal consultation has previously taken place in respect of closure of Nantmel C. in W. School.
8.19	Following recent retirement of the Head at Crossgates, Nantmel's Headteacher – having been trained whilst at Nantmel – was transferred from Nantmel to replace the Head at Crossgates, even though a number of other potential candidates were interviewed for the post – the Council would not have to pay redundancy then to the Head when the school closed, as the school would not have one.	The previous headteacher at Nantmel C. in W. School applied for the vacant headteacher position at Crossgates C.P. School and was appointed by the governing body following interview. This was not part of any strategic move by the authority.
8.20	Council bases information on pupil numbers from 2011 which stood at 36, yet in 2010 the number of children was 51 which is	The School Organisation Code requires local authorities to provide information on pupil numbers for the last 4 years and projections for the next 5 years. Although pupil numbers at the school may have been higher in 2010, the projections do not suggest

	practically full	that pupil numbers at the school will increase in the coming years.
8.21	The Council fails to recognise that it is not unreasonable for smaller schools to cost more than other schools. This doesn't necessarily affect the quality of education standards in those other schools and the argument that it is not fair to pupils in other schools is nonsense.	Nantmel C. in W. School was identified for review as it met a number of the criteria outlined in the authority's School Transformation Policy (2014). Whilst the quality of education provided at Nantmel C. in W. School is not one of the reasons why the authority is proposing closure of the school, the authority is satisfied that education of an equivalent standard would be provided at the named receiving school. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.' The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
8.22	Questions have been raised about the accuracy and effective working of the electronic voting system in the Council Chamber – how often is the system maintained and when was it last checked? This may have affected the outcome of votes, for example when councillors were voting at the extraordinary meeting on the 16 th June 2016.	The electronic voting system was fully tested on the 13 th July 2016 and was found to be in perfect working order. The minutes of the meeting of Powys County Council held on the 16 th June 2016, which included a link to the voting record, were approved as a correct record at the start of the meeting on the 13 th July 2016 without anyone challenging their accuracy.
8.23	Estimate that my child will be travelling for about an hour to and from the receiving school each day. Child currently walks to school in minutes, so this is 5 lost hours a week.	The authority accepts that the increase in travel will increase the length of the school day for children, however it is the authority's view that this increase would not be significant as the closest alternative school is within a 5 miles radius for most children.
8.24	Council states that it believes that closure would not result in an excessive length of school day – I do not believe that this has been properly thought through.	The authority accepts that the increase in travel will increase the length of the school day for children, however it is the authority's view that this increase would not be significant as the closest alternative school is within a 5 miles radius for most children.
8.25	Council has failed to acknowledge the discrimination that the school closure will	The authority has recognised that all pupils who are transported to school on authority commissioned Home to School Transport do not have the same access to

	cause in relation to extra-curricular activities – children will be limited to the bus timetable and this will lead to missed opportunities for after school activities.	extra-curricular activities that take place outside the school day. Should the school close, the authority would work with the Headteacher and Governing Body of the named receiving school and any other schools pupils might wish to transfer to, to ensure that participation in all school activity is maximised for all learners.
8.26	Significant number of comments made by the Council in response to the consultation report stating ‘The Authority notes this comment’ with no further response – this demonstrates that the concerns raised have not really been taken seriously.	All issues raised during the consultation period were taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to this proposal.
Objection 9		
9.1	Consultation report failed to address the context of concerns, to list the examples given and the responses were grossly insufficient	<p>In respect of the consultation report, the School Organisation Code states that:</p> <p>‘Within 13 weeks of the end of the period allowed for responses (and in any event prior to publication of the proposals), the proposer must publish a consultation report:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Summarising each of the issues raised by consultees; • Responding to these by means of clarification, amendment to the proposal or rejection of the concerns, with supporting reasons; and • Setting out Estyn’s view (as provided in its consultation response) of the overall merits of the proposal.’ <p>The authority is satisfied that the consultation report in respect of this proposal met the requirements of the Code.</p>
9.2	Failure of the authority to engage in objective decision making has been astounding	The consultation process in respect of this proposal has been carried out in-line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code. All issues raised in the consultation period were taken into consideration by Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to the proposal.

9.3	Cabinet members have failed to make themselves available to engage in meaningful conversation with parents, employees of the school and the community	The consultation process in respect of this proposal has been carried out in-line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code. This does not include a requirement for Cabinet members to make themselves available to engage in conversation. All consultation responses submitted via the correct procedure were addressed in the consultation report. Following a request at the consultation meeting, Cabinet members visited the school during the consultation period.
9.4	Members have failed to grasp the crux of the important views of parents, employees and the community	The authority is committed to ensuring that 'all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential.' As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.' The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. The Cabinet took the views expressed by parents, employees and the community into consideration when determining how to proceed in relation to the proposal.
9.5	Some Cabinet members have chosen to engage only with the softer option, the naïve vulnerable children, which is not wholly appropriate in the circumstances	The consultation process in respect of this proposal has been carried out in-line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code. This does not include a requirement for Cabinet members to make themselves available to engage in conversation. Following a request at the consultation meeting, Cabinet members visited the school during the consultation period, during these visits there were opportunities for them to speak with pupils at the affected schools.
9.6	Query as to how one of the ex-pupils of Nantmel, in amongst all the children in Rhayader School, find themselves talking to Cllr Avril York.	Following a request at the consultation meeting, Cabinet members visited the school during the consultation period, during these visits there were opportunities for them to speak with pupils at the affected schools, however the arrangements for the individual visits were made by the schools themselves.
9.7	Failure of the authority to adhere to the law of consultation has been outlined in the governor objection and I wish to affirm what has been stated	The consultation process has been carried out in line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code.
9.8	Have a number of complaints with the authority, the ombudsman and an FOI	The authority notes this comment. These complaints and requests will be addressed in line with the relevant procedures.

	request on the electronic voting system that requires urgent attention in relation to this consultation	
9.9	We have been ignored in pursuit of the authority's dogged haste to wrap this process up	The consultation process in respect of this proposal has been carried out in-line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code. The Cabinet took the views expressed during the consultation period into consideration when determining how to proceed in relation to the proposal. The authority has not demonstrated 'dogged haste to wrap this process up', however the authority is mindful of the fact that any school reorganisation proposal creates a period of uncertainty for those affected, and is keen to conclude the process as swiftly as possible to minimise the period of disruption for those affected.
9.10	News story on the authority's website on the 23 rd June 'Nantmel to close' fails to outline the objection period, neglects to mention that there is a continued process and that the final decision will be made after the objection period. Fails to tell the community and stakeholders of the necessary procedure to object, aiding a predetermined outcome.	The decision in respect of Nantmel C. in W. School has not been predetermined. At the Cabinet meeting held on the 23 rd June, Cabinet agreed to publish a formal proposal to close the school. We accept that the press release was not clear about the procedure for submitting Objections to the proposal, however all stakeholders were informed of the publication of the statutory notice in accordance with the School Organisation Code. All objections received during the objection period will be taken into consideration by Cabinet when make a final decision in respect of Nantmel C. in W. School.
9.11	We have been ignored by a Cabinet that have felt the need to recant personal experiences and bicker over petty politics rather than take the time to explore the depth of consultees views for conscientious consideration	All issues raised during the consultation period were taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to this proposal. The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
9.12	Not one Cabinet member has asked me why I have chosen Nantmel School but they are keen to lecture in Cabinet meetings their preferred school of Rhayader, wholly convenient to their cause.	The consultation process in respect of this proposal has been carried out in-line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code. The Cabinet took the views expressed during the consultation period into consideration when determining how to proceed in relation to the proposal.

9.13	Cabinet members should be required to look at many examples/case studies of other schools to inform this process.	The consultation process in respect of this proposal has been carried out in-line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code. The Cabinet took the views expressed during the consultation period into consideration when determining how to proceed in relation to the proposal.
9.14	I have undertaken work to identify examples/case studies of other schools to illustrate that a rural school can repopulate, yet this was not even included in the consultation report, why not?	<p>The consultation report lists the issues raised during the consultation period, and refers to a number of examples from other areas which were raised in the consultation responses.</p> <p>In respect of the consultation report, the School Organisation Code states that:</p> <p>‘Within 13 weeks of the end of the period allowed for responses (and in any event prior to publication of the proposals), the proposer must publish a consultation report:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Summarising each of the issues raised by consultees; • Responding to these by means of clarification, amendment to the proposal or rejection of the concerns, with supporting reasons; and • Setting out Estyn’s view (as provided in its consultation response) of the overall merits of the proposal.’ <p>The authority is satisfied that the consultation report in respect of this proposal met the requirements of the Code.</p>
9.15	The authority fails our schools, communities and younger generations, creating a self-fulfilling prophecy of an unsustainable county with an aging population.	The authority is committed to ensuring that ‘all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential.’ As stated in the One Powys Plan, ‘we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.’ The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, social and economic issues are non-educational issues.
Objection 10		

10.1	Nantmel is a close-knit and small rural community where school and church have exceptionally close links and are focal points for a great deal of community life.	The authority notes this comment, and acknowledges that closure of any school will have an impact on the community. A community impact assessment has been considered by Cabinet at each stage of the process. However, the aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, social and economic issues are non-educational issues.
10.2	The proposed closure of the school is certain to have an unfavourable impact on the lives of many – the Community Impact Assessment already submitted bears this out clearly	The authority notes this comment, and acknowledges that closure of any school will have an impact on the community. A community impact assessment has been considered by Cabinet at each stage of the process. However, the aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, social and economic issues are non-educational issues.
10.3	The school has been in existence for 160 years and continues to provide quality primary education in a clear Christian setting, offering children the additional and much-valued opportunity to mould themselves into their own community. This wonderful advantage might so easily vanish in a larger school.	The authority accepts that Nantmel C. in W. School has provided education for the local community over many years. However pupil numbers at the school are low, and are not expected to increase. The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, social and economic issues are non-educational issues.
10.4	The overall negative and unsettling impact of closure on the life of the community and the individuals who go to make it up, not least the children who attend the school, leads me to respectfully suggest that the decision reached be reconsidered as soon as possible.	The authority notes this comment, and acknowledges that closure of any school will have an impact on the community. A community impact assessment has been considered by Cabinet at each stage of the process. However, the aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, social and economic issues are non-educational issues.
Objection 11		
11.1	Nantmel School is an invaluable asset to the	Pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are currently small, and are not expected

	Powys Education System and the wider community	to increase in the coming years. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post-16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity'. The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
11.2	Sent my children to this school because of the attitude to student welfare at the school which was second to none	The authority notes this comment. All schools are expected to ensure the welfare of all pupils, and the authority has no reason to believe that commitment to pupil welfare would not continue at the receiving school or any other school pupils may wish to transfer to.
11.3	Some members of any population benefit from having a relationship with a smaller, more personal community venture such as Nantmel	The authority acknowledges that some pupils might be happier in a small class / school situation, however all schools are expected to ensure that pupils are happy in their learning environment. Should Nantmel C. in W. School close, the receiving school would be expected to provide full support to pupils to aid their transition. The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
11.4	Certain that a lot of the children at Nantmel would not have gone through the education system if the school had not existed, and the authority would do well to acknowledge the value that such an establishment brings to the county	The authority notes this comment. However, pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are currently small, and are not expected to increase in the coming years. The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
11.5	I can remember when the school was the only link to the outside world for 10 or so traveller children	The possible impact of the proposal to close Nantmel C. in W. School on pupils from the Gypsy/Traveller community was identified by the authority in the Equality Impact Assessment in respect of this proposal. However, there is no evidence that any pupils from the Gypsy/Traveller community currently attend the school.
11.6	Remember a time when Nantmel 'stole' lots of children from Rhayader School due to its community minded ethic	Nantmel C. in W. School is not currently the closest school for many of the pupils that currently attend the school, therefore the authority acknowledges that some families have made a choice for their children to attend the school. However, pupil numbers at the school are currently small, and are not expected to increase in the coming years. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post-16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and

		appropriate leadership capacity'. The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
11.7	There is precious little outlet to contact other members of the community in rural areas, and the school can act as a thriving hub that goes beyond mere education of children	The authority notes this comment. The impact of the proposal on the community was taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed. The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, economic and social factors are non-educational issues.
11.8	The school is especially valuable for isolated individuals and events, such as the 'duck race' where the whole community would meet up for a barbecue, this is something that is not factored in to your financial bill at the end of the year.	The authority notes this comment. The impact of the proposal on the community was taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed. The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, economic and social factors are non-educational issues.
11.9	There should be a mechanism to keep small schools going through inevitable lean periods.	The authority notes this comment. Nantmel C. in W. School was identified for review as it met a number of the criteria outlined in the authority's School Transformation Policy (2014). As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post-16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.' The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
Objection 12		
12.1	Find it astonishing that this period of the process has been conducted as such great speed	The process has been carried out in line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code.
12.2	Impression being given to the layman is that this is being rushed through at such a pace that it disadvantages the school considerably, and appears to fly in the face of fairness and local democracy.	The process has been carried out in line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code. The Cabinet meeting held on the 23 rd June 2016 was arranged in line with the requirements of the Local Government Act 1972.

12.3	The publication of the long and wordy consultation document at a very busy time in both the school year, and in the local farming year, does appear to be a heavily loaded dice.	The process has been carried out in line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code. The Cabinet meeting held on the 23 rd June 2016 was arranged in line with the requirements of the Local Government Act 1972.
12.4	Local government is not a business set up to make profit – is it not there to serve the people of the county?	It is true that local government is not a business set up to make a profit. The authority's aim is to ensure that 'all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential.' As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.' The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
12.5	Find it hard to understand why the councillors of the rural county that Powys is, wish to go down the same route as urban areas with regard to the schools that they provide.	<p>As stated in the authority's revised Schools Organisation Policy, approved by Cabinet in November 2015, the council acknowledges that 'In a rural county as diverse as Powys there is no one size fits all approach to school organisation. Consideration will be given to the specific circumstances of each school/s and community.' However, pupil numbers in Nantmel C. in W. School are low and are not expected to increase significantly.</p> <p>As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.' A range of options were taken into consideration by the School Organisation Review Panel before agreeing the draft recommendation to close the school.</p>
12.6	What works in a city or a town might not be the right model for a rural, farming community.	<p>As stated in the authority's revised Schools Organisation Policy, approved by Cabinet in November 2015, the council acknowledges that 'In a rural county as diverse as Powys there is no one size fits all approach to school organisation. Consideration will be given to the specific circumstances of each school/s and community.' However, pupil numbers in Nantmel C. in W. School are low and are not expected to increase significantly.</p> <p>As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary,</p>

		secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.’ A range of options were taken into consideration by the School Organisation Review Panel before agreeing the draft recommendation to close the school.
12.7	Is it not the duty of councillors to look beyond a simple balance sheet of numbers which is presented to them as almost set in stone?	All issues raised during the consultation period were taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to this Proposal.
12.8	Education is different to other areas of public spending such as health, social services, police, fire service, as it looks forward, for a future of hope, life-long learning, fulfilment in work and the whole of life, active participation in society and its culture, and many other positive things that our children can look forward to – these things are beyond measure and very difficult to put a price on.	The authority agrees in relation to the importance of providing high-quality education to all pupils. The authority’s aim is to ensure that ‘all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential.’ As stated in the One Powys Plan, ‘we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.’ The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
12.9	Is it not our duty to do all we can to ensure that every child can fulfil their potential? Children only have one chance at school.	The authority agrees with this point, and this is reflected in the authority’s aim to ensure that ‘all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential.’ The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
12.10	Children are unique – individuals with different personalities, abilities, gifts, learning styles and so on. Not one style or method of teaching fits all.	The authority agrees that children are unique and that not one style or method of teaching fits all. However, all schools are expected to treat each child as individuals and to address their individual needs.
12.11	Not every child will thrive in a village school, not every child will thrive in a large town school	The authority acknowledges that some pupils might be happier in a small class / school situation, however all schools are expected to ensure that pupils are happy in their learning environment. Should Nantmel C. in W. School close, the receiving school would be expected to provide full support to pupils to aid their transition. The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.

12.12	Rural children have a right to be educated in an environment that is more attuned to their way of life.	The authority notes this comment, however pupil numbers in Nantmel C. in W. School are low and are not expected to increase significantly. Whilst Rhayader C. in W. School, the named receiving school, is located in the town of Rhayader, the school serves a wide catchment area, and the pupils that attend are a mixture of pupils living within Rhayader and pupils living in the rural area surrounding Rhayader. The authority is confident that Rhayader C. in W. School, and any other school pupils may wish to transfer to, would be able to meet the needs of children from a rural background.
12.13	Why are we forcing all children into the same mould of the urban model?	<p>As stated in the authority's revised Schools Organisation Policy, approved by Cabinet in November 2015, the council acknowledges that 'In a rural county as diverse as Powys there is no one size fits all approach to school organisation. Consideration will be given to the specific circumstances of each school/s and community.' However, pupil numbers in Nantmel C. in W. School are low and are not expected to increase significantly.</p> <p>As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.' A range of options were taken into consideration by the School Organisation Review Panel before agreeing the draft recommendation to close the school.</p>
12.14	Some rural children would be very happy in a town school, as would some town children be in a small village school, but we must offer both.	The authority acknowledges that some pupils might be happier in a small class / school situation, however all schools are expected to ensure that pupils are happy in their learning environment. Should Nantmel C. in W. School close, the receiving school would be expected to provide full support to pupils to aid their transition. Pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are low, and are not expected to increase in the coming years. The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
12.15	Of course the small school will cost more per pupil, but it should be there as an alternative.	Nantmel C. in W. School was identified for review as it met a number of criteria as outlined in the Schools Transformation Policy (2014), one of which relates to cost per pupil.

		As stated in the One Powys Plan, ‘we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.’ The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
12.16	It is about fulfilling the potential of all of our children that is at stake here – not just those for whom a large school is the best thing.	<p>The authority’s aim is to ensure that ‘all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential.’ However, pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are low, and are not expected to increase in the coming years. The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.</p> <p>The authority acknowledges that some pupils might be happier in a small class / school situation, however all schools are expected to ensure that pupils are happy in their learning environment. Should Nantmel C. in W. School close, the receiving school would be expected to provide full support to pupils to aid their transition.</p>
12.17	Not beyond the bounds of possibility that this could work within the current financial settlements – money may have to be diverted from other areas to this vital positive, life-changing area of education	Pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are low, and are not expected to increase in the coming years. The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
12.18	If Nantmel were given the all clear to remain open, with no possibility of yet another review of its sustainability for several years, we would see an increase in numbers attending the school.	As stated in the consultation document, there were 36 pupils at Nantmel C. in W. School in January 2011, and pupil numbers have decreased since then. The pupil projections for Nantmel C. in W. School that were considered before this process started did not suggest any significant increase in pupil numbers. The authority notes that any school reorganisation process will lead to a period of uncertainty for those affected, however no formal consultation has previously taken place in respect of closure of Nantmel C. in W. School.
12.19	The school has suffered terribly from the stigma of the threat of closure, which has dissuaded some from coming who would have done so under normal circumstances.	As stated in the consultation document, there were 36 pupils at Nantmel C. in W. School in January 2011, and pupil numbers have decreased since then. The pupil projections for Nantmel C. in W. School that were considered before this process started did not suggest any significant increase in pupil numbers. The authority notes that any school reorganisation process will lead to a period of uncertainty for those affected, however no formal consultation has previously taken place in respect of

		closure of Nantmel C. in W. School.
12.20	One of the different models of federation or amalgamation could provide a management and governance structure for the school, even if this means extra cost beyond the average.	The School Organisation Review Panel (SORP) considered a range of options when deciding on the draft recommendation to be considered by Cabinet in respect of Nantmel C. in W. School. However these were not considered to be a suitable solution in this case. All alternative options suggested during the consultation were considered by Cabinet when determining the way forward in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School. Pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are low, and are not expected to increase in the coming years. The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
12.21	Other possibilities have been quickly dismissed because, we are told, they are not financially viable under the current funding formula.	The authority notes this comment. Pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are low, and are not expected to increase in the coming years. The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
12.22	The funding formula could be changed if there was a will to do so, and this would enhance the provision we would be offering to our children, and schools and education would reflect more accurately the diversity of the county.	<p>The authority notes this comment. It is true that local authorities determine for themselves the size of their Local Schools Budget (LSB) and the formula used to allocate funding to schools. Any proposed changes to the fair funding formula will be consulted upon and agreed by the Cabinet before the end of the December prior to the commencement of the financial year to which they apply. The Fair Funding Formula must comply with the legislative provisions of sections 45-53 of the School Standards and Framework Act 1998 and as further detailed in the School Funding (Wales) Regulations 2010.</p> <p>However, pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are low, and are not expected to increase in the coming years. The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.</p>
Objection 13		
13.1	I have a lot of friends at the school	The authority notes this comment and accepts that any school reorganisation proposal creates a period of uncertainty for pupils. Should the school close, the

		receiving school or any other school pupils might wish to transfer to would provide support to pupils to aid their transition, and to ensure that they are settled in their new school. Should pupils transfer to different schools to their friends, they would continue to be able to see each other outside school, and as there would be more pupils in the alternative schools, pupils would be able to make new friends.
13.2	I learn lots in school, inside and outside	The authority notes this comment, but would hope that this would continue to be the case in the named receiving school or any other school pupils might transfer to.
13.3	We have a wonderful garden where we grow lots of things that we sell to parents, grandparents and other people in the village	The authority notes this comment.
13.4	Please come and see our wonderful school	Cabinet members visited Nantmel C. in W. School and the named receiving school during the consultation period.
Objection 14		
14.1	The date on the front of the Consultation Document itself was incorrect – it stated that the consultation period was from 29 th January to 11 th March 2016 which is completely wrong and in fact it was advising the public that the period in which to respond had already ended. This was also true of the response form/questionnaire and the young people's consultation document.	The dates on the Consultation Document, Response Form and Young People's Version are the dates of the original consultation period. When the consultation period was extended, stakeholders were advised of this and of the new closing date by letter. This information was also issued as a press release. In addition, the council's website clearly showed the revised closing date from the date consultation period was extended.
14.2	The errors listed above will result in a further extension of the consultation period because the documents are not in accordance with the correct procedure.	The dates on the Consultation Document, Response Form and Young People's Version are the dates of the original consultation period. When the consultation period was extended, stakeholders were advised of this and of the new closing date by letter. This information was also issued as a press release. In addition, the council's website clearly showed the revised closing date from the date consultation

		period was extended.
14.3	The publication of the incorrect closing date for the consultation will have misled people into believing that it is too late to send in their responses. I welcome your comments on how you will address this situation.	When the consultation period was extended, stakeholders were advised of this and of the new closing date by letter. This information was also issued as a press release. In addition, the council's website clearly showed the revised closing date from the date the consultation period was extended. The authority does not accept that the council misled people into believing it was too late to send in their responses.
14.4	I am very much opposed to the proposed closure of Nantmel School.	The authority notes this comment.
14.5	We are not addressing issues relating to a failing school – quite the reverse.	The quality of education provided at Nantmel C. in W. School is not one of the reasons why closure of the school is being proposed. However, should the school close, the authority is satisfied that education of an equivalent standard would be provided to pupils at the named receiving school. Nantmel C. in W. School was identified for review as it met a number of the criteria outlined in the authority's School Transformation Policy (2014).
14.6	Nantmel has an excellent teaching history spanning almost 160 years.	The authority accepts that Nantmel C. in W. School has provided education for the local community over many years. However pupil numbers at the school are low, and are not expected to increase. The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
14.7	The standard of pupils' education is paramount and must not be compromised and yet it would appear that the barometer by which we are judging the importance of our children's education is not by standards of achievements, community spirit or convenience, but solely by monetary costs.	Nantmel C. in W. School was identified for review as it met a number of the criteria outlined in the authority's School Transformation Policy (2014). The authority agrees that the standard of pupils' education is paramount and must not be compromised. Whilst the quality of education provided at Nantmel C. in W. School is not one of the reasons why the authority is proposing closure of the school, the authority is satisfied that education of an equivalent standard would be provided at the named receiving school.
14.8	Little attention is being paid to the needs of and impact on the pupils.	The authority has acknowledged that any school reorganisation proposal creates a period of uncertainty for pupils, however should the school close, the receiving school or any other school pupils might wish to transfer to would provide support to

		<p>pupils to aid their transition.</p> <p>The authority is committed to ensuring that ‘all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential’, however as stated in the One Powys Plan, ‘we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.’ The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.</p>
14.9	<p>We are simply on a cost saving exercise for Powys County Council which so far has paid little attention to the needs of the pupils themselves or to the wider impact and costs which will fall to the Community in terms of accessibility and availability of after school activities as well as the loss of the only public building for community events, social gatherings, learning classes, engagements with all age groups.</p>	<p>It is not true that this is simply a cost saving exercise. Nantmel C. in W. School was identified for review as it met a number of the criteria outlined in the authority’s School Transformation Policy (2014). The authority is committed to ensuring that ‘all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential’, however as stated in the One Powys Plan, ‘we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.’ The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.</p>
14.10	<p>Nantmel does not have a village hall.</p>	<p>This has been acknowledged by the authority in the Community Impact Assessment in respect of this proposal.</p>
14.11	<p>I have considerable doubts about any alleged financial savings.</p>	<p>The estimated savings were included in the consultation document in respect of this proposal. These were reviewed and updated in the paper considered by Cabinet on the 23rd June 2016.</p>
14.12	<p>Over recent months we have received a plethora of statistics and forecasts indicating what savings might be made, these forecasts have differed on every occasion.</p>	<p>The estimated savings were included in the consultation document in respect of this proposal. These were reviewed and updated in the paper considered by Cabinet on the 23rd June 2016.</p>
14.13	<p>I am not entirely satisfied that all aspects of the Portfolio’s report are genuine.</p>	<p>The data included in the papers that have been considered by Cabinet is the most up-to-date verified data that was available at the time.</p>

14.14	One glaring omission in the report is a table showing the annual interest charges incurred by each of the smaller schools on capital expenditure. If these statistics were included, I am sure it would demonstrate that when taken into account the cost per pupil at Nantmel School will be very substantially less than other similar schools. I hope these figures will be published.	All capital expenditure is managed and funded within the overarching capital strategy for the council. These costs are not allocated to individual schools.
14.15	Redundancy costs have not been factored in.	It is true that redundancy costs have not been included. This is clearly stated in the consultation document. Redundancy costs are a one-off cost.
14.16	There are endless reasons why Nantmel School should not be closed	Nantmel C. in W. School was identified for review as it met a number of the criteria outlined in the authority's School Transformation Policy (2014). A large number of issues were raised during the consultation period and these were taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to this proposal.
14.17	It is hard to stress too much the importance and significance of this school to the large area which is the small village of Nantmel.	The authority notes this comment. All issues raised during the consultation period in relation to the proposal's impact on the community were taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School. The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, social and economic factors are non-educational issues.
14.18	The school is pivotal to the appeal of the local community to young families.	The authority notes this comment. All issues raised during the consultation period in relation to the proposal's impact on the community were taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School. The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, social and economic factors are non-educational issues.
14.19	For nearly 160 years the young of this parish have started their education in the safety of	The authority accepts that Nantmel C. in W. School has provided education for the local community over many years. However pupil numbers at the school are low, and

	their own school. Do not destroy this because it will be impossible to bring back.	are not expected to increase. The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
14.20	The school has been a constant in the life of the village for 160 years.	The authority accepts that Nantmel C. in W. School has provided education for the local community over many years. However pupil numbers at the school are low, and are not expected to increase. The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
14.21	The current recommendation for closure is based on inconsistent figures.	The authority does not agree with this statement.
14.22	The prospect of Nantmel becoming part of a federation is clearly a viable option – the current set up is working well.	The School Organisation Review Panel (SORP) considered the option of federation and a range of other options when deciding on the draft recommendation to be considered by Cabinet in respect of Nantmel C. in W. School. However this was not considered to be a suitable solution in this case. All alternative options suggested during the consultation were considered by Cabinet when determining the way forward in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School.
14.23	Federation has been and is being adopted successfully in Powys schools.	It is true that there is one example of a formal federation within Powys. This model is proving successful to date. Two out of the three schools have had a successful Estyn inspection since its establishment.
14.24	The school organisation code makes it clear that consideration should be given to the alternative of federating schools when local authorities review provision with a view to potential closure.	The School Organisation Review Panel (SORP) considered the option of federation and a range of other options when deciding on the draft recommendation to be considered by Cabinet in respect of Nantmel C. in W. School. However this was not considered to be a suitable solution in this case. All alternative options suggested during the consultation were considered by Cabinet when determining the way forward in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School.
14.25	The Welsh Government's own policy sees the benefits of federation especially for our youngest children if it allows them to be educated in their own communities rather than being transported for miles.	The School Organisation Review Panel (SORP) considered the option of federation and a range of other options when deciding on the draft recommendation to be considered by Cabinet in respect of Nantmel C. in W. School. However this was not considered to be a suitable solution in this case. All alternative options suggested during the consultation were considered by Cabinet when determining the way forward in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School. Pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W.

		School are low and are not expected to increase in the coming years. The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
14.26	It is essential that we maintain our Primary schools to meet projected increases in pupil numbers in future years.	The projected pupil numbers for Nantmel C. in W. School which were included in the consultation document do not suggest that pupil numbers at the school will increase in the coming years. The authority is satisfied that there is sufficient available places in the named receiving school to accommodate any increase in pupil numbers in future years.
14.27	We were given a stark warning recently by the Head of Schools who said for the first time in many years more pupils started in the primary sector in September 2015 and there are large areas in Powys where we have no spare capacity.	The projected pupil numbers for Nantmel C. in W. School which were included in the consultation document do not suggest that pupil numbers at the school will increase in the coming years. The authority is satisfied that there is sufficient available places in the named receiving school to accommodate any increase in pupil numbers in future years.
14.28	We are fast approaching a position where we no longer have rural schools to close.	The authority notes this comment. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity'. The aim of this proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
14.29	'The tide is turning' and we have to be very careful not to create a capital expenditure because we have no money to build a new school or extensions to existing schools.	The projected pupil numbers for Nantmel C. in W. School which were included in the consultation document do not suggest that pupil numbers at the school will increase in the coming years. The authority is satisfied that there is sufficient available places in the named receiving school to accommodate any increase in pupil numbers in future years.
14.30	We need to be sure of capacity or we will find ourselves transporting our urban children out into the rural areas – this will not be possible if we close our rural schools.	The projected pupil numbers for Nantmel C. in W. School which were included in the consultation document do not suggest that pupil numbers at the school will increase in the coming years. The authority is satisfied that there is sufficient available places in the named receiving school to accommodate any increase in pupil numbers in future years.
14.31	The Cabinet have an important decision to	The consultation report in respect of this proposal was taken into consideration by

	make which will have a profound effect on the community of Nantmel.	the Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to this proposal, and the objections received will be taken into consideration when making a final decision in respect of this proposal.
14.32	Any meagre saving which might be achieved by closure which might be achieved by closure wouldn't even be enough to pay the salary of a single senior officer in Powys.	The authority notes this comment. The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
14.33	The damage that any closure would inflict both on the Community and the County Council would never be worth it.	All issues raised during the consultation period were taken into consideration by Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School, and all objections received will be taken into consideration by Cabinet when making a final decision in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School. The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, social and economic factors are non-educational issues.
14.34	The sustainability of our rural areas is at stake here.	All issues raised during the consultation period were taken into consideration by Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School, and all objections received will be taken into consideration by Cabinet when making a final decision in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School. The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, social and economic factors are non-educational issues.
14.35	My opposition to closure of the school is shared by the school governors, parents, pupils, Nantmel Community Council, Rhayader Town Council, Radnorshire Committee of Powys County Council as well as the residents of Nantmel parish.	All issues raised during the consultation period were taken into consideration by Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School, and all objections received will be taken into consideration by Cabinet when making a final decision in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School.
14.36	A petition opposing closure and containing some 841 names was also submitted to the County Council	The authority notes this comment. This petition was presented to Cabinet prior to their meeting on the 15 th December 2016 when the commencement of consultation on closure of Nantmel C. in W. School was approved, and was taken into consideration by Cabinet when making this decision.

14.37	I have yet to find anyone who advocates the closure.	<p>The authority notes this comment. As stated in the One Powys Plan, ‘we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.’ The aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.</p> <p>The Proposal is aligned with the requirements of the Welsh Government’s School Organisation Code, which states that ‘Relevant bodies should place the interests of learners above all others. With reference to the key questions of the Office of Her Majesty’s Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales (Estyn), they should give paramount importance to the likely impact of the proposals on the quality of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • outcomes (standards and wellbeing); • provision (learning experiences, teaching, care, support and guidance, and learning environment); and • leadership and management (leadership, improving quality, partnership working and resource management)’.
Objection 15		
15.1	I am extremely disappointed by the way the Consultation is being handled by the County Council in general and the Cabinet in particular.	The consultation has been carried out in accordance with the requirements of the Welsh Government’s School Organisation Code.
15.2	Astonished at the speed with which an emergency Cabinet meeting was held on 23 rd June to debate such an important matter.	<p>The Cabinet meeting held on 23rd June was properly convened.</p> <p>Section 100A of the Local Government Act 1972 requires that public notice of the time and place of the meeting shall be given by posting it at the offices of the council at least three clear days before the meeting. A notice was put up on the notice board on the 16th June.</p> <p>Section 100B Local Government Act 1972) requires that copies of any report are available for public inspection at least three clear days before the meeting. The agenda and report were published on the website on the 17th June.</p>

15.3	Cabinet meeting was called less than a week after the full Council met on 16th June and decided on the way forward for considering the Powys Schools Transformation Proposals.	<p>The Cabinet meeting held on 23rd June was properly convened.</p> <p>Section 100A of the Local Government Act 1972 requires that public notice of the time and place of the meeting shall be given by posting it at the offices of the council at least three clear days before the meeting. A notice was put up on the notice board on the 16th June.</p> <p>Section 100B Local Government Act 1972 requires that copies of any report are available for public inspection at least three clear days before the meeting. The agenda and report were published on the website on the 17th June.</p>
15.4	Gives the impression that Cabinet preferred to keep the reports to themselves before the Cabinet made a decision on their contents.	<p>The Cabinet meeting held on 23rd June was properly convened.</p> <p>Section 100A of the Local Government Act 1972 requires that public notice of the time and place of the meeting shall be given by posting it at the offices of the council at least three clear days before the meeting. A notice was put up on the notice board on the 16th June.</p> <p>Section 100B Local Government Act 1972 requires that copies of any report are available for public inspection at least three clear days before the meeting. The agenda and report were published on the website on the 17th June.</p>
15.5	Consultation document and Portfolio Holder's Report extending to some 200 pages were received by me in the afternoon of Friday 13 th June – I did not receive a draft copy of the Portfolio Holder's Report beforehand for consideration and views as local member for inclusion in the report before official publication as is the normal procedure – why not?	<p>The documentation was sent to the Local Member at 11.53 on Friday 17th June. At this point, the Cabinet report was still in draft form – the title of the document was 'Nantmel Cabinet Report June 2016 draft v3'. The Local Member was invited to provide their local member comment as soon as they were able.</p> <p>It is true that the Cabinet papers were published soon after the draft report was sent to the Local Member. Further messages were sent to the Local Member on the 20th and 21st June inviting him to provide written comments for inclusion in the report, however he declined this invitation – a statement to this effect received from him on the 21st June was included in the Cabinet Report.</p>
15.6	I was only allowed just three working days to	The Cabinet meeting held on 23 rd June was properly convened, in accordance with

	read, study and prepare a presentation to the Cabinet meeting on 23 rd June 2016. During those three days I was expected to contact all the governors, parents, staff and other stakeholders to obtain their responses to the Consultation Document and the PH's report to Cabinet which few of them would have seen or even know they existed.	the requirements of the Local Government Act 1972.
15.7	Governors, parents, staff etc did not receive an email informing them that the Consultation Document was available – so much for genuine, open and transparent community consultation about which the Cabinet so frequently boasted.	Governors, parents and staff were advised of the publication of the Consultation Document prior to the Cabinet meeting on the 23 rd June 2016. The process undertaken is in line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code.
15.8	Demonstrates clearly just how little is taken of the views and concerns of the local inhabitants of Powys on issues of the utmost importance.	Full consideration was given to the consultation report in respect of the proposal to close Nantmel C. in W. School, which listed the views and concerns of the local inhabitants, when making a decision on how to proceed in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School.
15.9	Assurances and solemn promises made by officers, the PH and Leader have been broken by them all.	The process carried out in respect of Nantmel C. in W. School is in line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code. The arrangements for the Cabinet meeting held on the 23 rd June 2016 were in-line with the requirements of the Local Government Act 1972.
15.10	Over the past nine months the governors, staff and parents have worked hard to contribute to and co-operate with the consultation process.	The authority notes that a large number of responses were received during the consultation period. The issues raised in these responses were included in the Consultation Report, which was taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to this proposal.
15.11	The Council has spent thousands of pounds engaging Consultants to assist Officers in their efforts to produce the Consultation Document.	No Consultants were employed by the authority to assist with the production of the Consultation Document or the Consultation Report in relation to the proposal to close Nantmel C. in W. School. The only time Consultants were employed in relation to this proposal was to facilitate the public meeting held at the school during the

		consultation period.
15.12	We were promised that all stakeholders would have ample time to read, study and challenge the Consultation Report before it was considered by the Cabinet – what actually happened was that no one was allowed sufficient time to read, study, understand and respond to the document before it went to Cabinet.	The authority did not make this promise. The purpose of the Consultation Report is to outline the issues raised during the consultation period and to provide the authority's response to these issues. There is no requirement for the authority to engage with stakeholders on the content of the document before it is considered by Cabinet.
15.13	Why did the Council proceed with such haste and why were these promises not honoured? Was it to deliberately restrict or/and prevent any debate on the document before a decision was made by Cabinet?	The process carried out in respect of Nantmel C. in W. School is in line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code. The arrangements for the Cabinet meeting held on the 23 rd June 2016 were in-line with the requirements of the Local Government Act 1972.
15.14	It was not possible for a reasoned, well considered presentation addressing the views of the stakeholders to be placed before the Cabinet by the local member on the 23 rd June which is most regrettable and disrespectful to everyone.	The 5 minute limit on speeches at Cabinet meetings was approved by full Council on 20 th April 2016 as one of a number of amendments to the Constitution.
15.15	As local member, I attended the cabinet meeting and attempted to make a presentation on behalf of the school but regrettably I was not allowed sufficient time to address members of the Cabinet on a matter which was of such immense importance to the people I represent.	The 5 minute limit on speeches at Cabinet meetings was approved by full Council on 20 th April 2016 as one of a number of amendments to the Constitution.
15.16	It was a disgrace that I was expected to speak on reports extending to over 200 pages in just five minutes and even then I	The 5 minute limit on speeches at Cabinet meetings was approved by full Council on 20 th April 2016 as one of a number of amendments to the Constitution.

	was continually interrupted to remind me how many seconds I had left to speak.	
15.17	There are few matters more important to a ward member than the possible closure of his local school.	The authority is fully aware that possible closure of a local school is a very important matter to residents of the ward in which the school is located. All issues raised during the consultation period were included in the Consultation Report in respect of this proposal, which was taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed.
15.18	This was the only matter on the agenda that day and absolutely no thought or consideration was given to my position or the concerns of the people I represent. This is democracy the Powys County Council way!	The 5 minute limit on speeches at Cabinet meetings was approved by full Council on 20 th April 2016 as one of a number of amendments to the Constitution. At the Cabinet meeting, the Cabinet considered the consultation report and the issues presented by the Local Member when determining how to proceed in respect of this proposal.
15.19	It was within the Cabinet's power to use some discretion for my plight but unfortunately no thought, understanding or appreciation of the seriousness of the matter before us was shown.	The 5 minute limit on speeches at Cabinet meetings was approved by full Council on 20 th April 2016 as one of a number of amendments to the Constitution.
15.20	As Councillors we need sometimes to be reminded that we are on the Council to do our best to look after the interests of those we represent but as Councillors we also need to be given a fair chance to do this. At present we do not have this opportunity to do this and the situation needs addressing with some urgency.	All issues raised during the consultation period were taken into consideration by Cabinet members when determining how to proceed in relation to this proposal. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.' The aim of this proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
15.21	What a waste of public money and effort by so many and all to count for nothing.	The authority is required to go through a statutory consultation process in accordance with the School Organisation Code in respect of any proposal to close a school. This is part of the work of the authority's School Modernisation Team and other officers, and is part of the role of Cabinet members, therefore there is no additional cost to the authority. In respect of this proposal, there was a cost of £936

		for the consultants who facilitated the public meeting, as well as a cost of £50 for the hire of translation equipment.
15.22	Why was this large and expensive Consultation Report not made available for everyone to see well before the Cabinet meeting was held to decide on such an important matter which will have serious implications for so many?	<p>The Council's usual practice in respect of school reorganisation proposals is that the Consultation Report is published with the Cabinet papers one week before the Cabinet meeting. This is in-line with the arrangements during the recent proposals in respect of Talgarth and Bronllys CP Schools, Ysgol Dolafon and the Specialist Centre at Crickhowell CP School.</p> <p>Section 100B Local Government Act 1972) requires that copies of any report are available for public inspection at least three clear days before the meeting. The agenda and report were published on the website on the 17th June.</p>
15.23	There was no opportunity for any sort of engagement with the stakeholders or public before the Cabinet made a decision on its contents.	Engagement with stakeholders and the public was the purpose of the consultation period in respect of this proposal. The consultation report is the outcome of the consultation period, and summarises all issues raised during the consultation period for the consideration of the Cabinet when determining how to proceed. There is no requirement for the Council to carry out any engagement with stakeholders or the public on the content of the consultation report.
15.24	This large and costly Consultation Document has not received one ounce of independent scrutiny or challenge despite a promise that there would be an opportunity for scrutiny by the People Committee.	The Consultation Document was produced in accordance with the School Organisation Code and was scrutinised by stakeholders during the consultation period. All issues raised in relation to the Consultation Document are listed in the Consultation Report, along with the authority's response.
15.25	The Consultation Report is fundamentally flawed because it contains so many inaccuracies, has so many gaps in the information supplied and has no outcomes – the list is endless.	<p>In respect of the consultation report, the School Organisation Code states that:</p> <p>'Within 13 weeks of the end of the period allowed for responses (and in any event prior to publication of the proposals), the proposer must publish a consultation report:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Summarising each of the issues raised by consultees; • Responding to these by means of clarification, amendment to the proposal or rejection of the concerns, with supporting reasons; and

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Setting out Estyn's view (as provided in its consultation response) of the overall merits of the proposal.' <p>The authority is satisfied that the consultation report in respect of this proposal met the requirements of the Code.</p>
15.26	The main thrust of this report is hugely disappointing.	<p>In respect of the consultation report, the School Organisation Code states that:</p> <p>'Within 13 weeks of the end of the period allowed for responses (and in any event prior to publication of the proposals), the proposer must publish a consultation report:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Summarising each of the issues raised by consultees; Responding to these by means of clarification, amendment to the proposal or rejection of the concerns, with supporting reasons; and Setting out Estyn's view (as provided in its consultation response) of the overall merits of the proposal.' <p>The authority is satisfied that the consultation report in respect of this proposal met the requirements of the Code.</p>
15.27	It really is just a report about children from a rural school which is not the smallest of the most expensive.	<p>In respect of the consultation report, the School Organisation Code states that:</p> <p>'Within 13 weeks of the end of the period allowed for responses (and in any event prior to publication of the proposals), the proposer must publish a consultation report:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Summarising each of the issues raised by consultees; Responding to these by means of clarification, amendment to the proposal or rejection of the concerns, with supporting reasons; and Setting out Estyn's view (as provided in its consultation response) of the overall merits of the proposal.' <p>The authority is satisfied that the consultation report in respect of this proposal met the requirements of the Code.</p>

15.28	The most recent Estyn inspection gave the school a Good but the pupils would be forced to attend a school who's most recent inspection was rated as Adequate, all to save a few pennies.	This is true, however Rhayader C. in W. School has now been removed from Estyn's list of schools requiring monitoring as a result of making good progress to address the recommendations from the core inspection. Rhayader C. in W. School was classified by Welsh Government as a yellow school in 2015/16.
15.29	This will literally save only a few pennies once other costs have been taken into account, and that doesn't even factor in all the other social, economic and environmental costs to the wider community.	<p>The original savings following implementation of this proposal were included in the consultation document. These were rerun for the 16/17 financial year prior to the proposal being considered by Cabinet on the 23rd June. This led to a reduction in the estimated savings to £54,000, due to the number of funded pupils reducing, which led to a reduction in the small schools allowance.</p> <p>All issues raised in respect of the social, economic and environmental impact of the proposal were listed in the consultation report, which was taken into consideration by Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to this proposal.</p>
15.30	If only the finance department of Education Services were ever able to produce the real costs I would suggest that there would be no saving to the Council.	The original savings following implementation of this proposal were included in the consultation document. These were rerun for the 16/17 financial year prior to the proposal being considered by Cabinet on the 23 rd June. This led to a reduction in the estimated savings to £54,000, due to the number of funded pupils reducing, which led to a reduction in the small schools allowance.
15.31	It would appear that Powys County Council's Mission Statement "Stronger Communities in the Green Heart of Wales" doesn't cover all communities, particularly so if they are rural.	It is true that the council's vision is 'Stronger Communities in the Green Heart of Wales, and this vision applies to all communities in Powys. However, one of the council's priorities, as outlined in the One Powys Plan, is 'Transforming Learning and Skills'. Within this priority, the Plan states that 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.'
15.32	We are not asking for new facilities we are just asking to keep the one's we have got.	The authority notes this comment, however pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are small and are not expected to increase in the coming years. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.'

15.33	The projected savings have not been updated to reflect the reduced guesstimate of £54,000.	The revised estimated savings were updated in the Report considered by Cabinet on the 23 rd June. The authority refutes the accusation that this was a 'guesstimate'.
15.34	All the figures remain unreliable.	The authority does not agree with this comment.
15.35	The canteen subsidy is not the actual cost and therefore will not be an actual saving.	As stated in the consultation report, the figure used in the consultation document was an estimate, further work has been carried out and the actual figure for 2015/16 was £9,980.
15.36	No redundancy costs have been factored in.	The authority acknowledges that the estimated savings do not include redundancy costs, and this is clearly stated in the consultation document. Redundancy costs are a one-off cost.
15.37	Nantmel School made a surplus of £24338 in 2015/16 and is projected to make a surplus of £8034 in 2016/17. Why doesn't the report reflect this and where is the background information?	The authority acknowledged in the Consultation Report that Nantmel C. in W. School had a surplus of £24,338 at the end of the 2015/16 financial year.
15.38	Estyn's response to the Consultation Document is extremely critical.	In line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code, Estyn's response to the consultation document is included in the consultation report. All issues raised in Estyn's response were listed in the consultation report along with the authority's response. Estyn's response was taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School.
15.39	Estyn states that Powys County Council has not analysed the current performance of the schools affected by the proposal nor has it provided a robust enough consideration of its own, or the regional consortium's view of the performance of the schools. This lack of information does not make it possible for Estyn to judge the likely impact of the proposal on standards and the quality of	In line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code, Estyn's response to the consultation document is included in the consultation report. All issues raised in Estyn's response were listed in the consultation report along with the authority's response. Estyn's response was taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to Nantmel C. in W. School.

	provision for pupils in the area.	
15.40	Nantmel School building is 'C' and can easily be brought up to at least 'B' – Rhayader School is 'D' – your comments on this please.	As stated in the consultation document, the building at Rhayader was given a Condition assessment of B by surveyors appointed by the Welsh Government in 2009. The assessment of D was for Sustainability.
15.41	The report does not deal robustly enough with the many disadvantages and risks identified.	<p>In respect of the consultation report, the School Organisation Code states that:</p> <p>'Within 13 weeks of the end of the period allowed for responses (and in any event prior to publication of the proposals), the proposer must publish a consultation report:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Summarising each of the issues raised by consultees; • Responding to these by means of clarification, amendment to the proposal or rejection of the concerns, with supporting reasons; and • Setting out Estyn's view (as provided in its consultation response) of the overall merits of the proposal.' <p>The authority is satisfied that the consultation report in respect of this proposal met the requirements of the Code.</p>
15.42	Additional travel is not addressed.	The authority noted in the consultation document that closure of Nantmel C. in W. School would lead to an increase in travel for a number of pupils for whom Nantmel is currently their closest school, however there would also be a reduction in travel for some pupils should they transfer to their closest school. The authority's view is that any additional travel would not be excessive as the closest alternative school is within a 5 mile radius for most children. Any additional travel for pupils would be within the time limits identified in the authority's home to school transport policy.
15.43	It will be more difficult for parents on low incomes due to the additional travel required of parents in order to attend activities at the receiving school or to collect pupils from after school activities. No suggestions have been made as to how to address this.	The authority has previously accepted that parents will have increased travel to allow their children to access after school activities, and that this may have a greater impact on parents on low incomes. Should Nantmel C. in W. School close, the authority would work with and support the receiving school and any other school to which pupils may transfer to maximise the access to extra-curricular opportunities for pupils.

15.44	Closure of Nantmel School would have a detrimental impact on the facilities available to the local community.	The authority has identified that closure of the school would have a detrimental impact on the facilities available to the local community in the community impact assessment in relation to this proposal, and this was taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed. The building currently occupied by Nantmel C. in W. School is owned by the Church, and should the school close, it would be a matter for the Church to decide on future use of the building.
15.45	Estyn notes it is clear that the community of Nantmel makes use of the school's facilities for a range of activities and events due to the fact that there is no other suitable location to hold these activities in the village. This situation has not been addressed.	This has been identified by the authority in the community impact assessment in relation to this proposal, and was taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed. The building currently occupied by Nantmel C. in W. School is owned by the Church, and should the school close, it would be a matter for the Church to decide on future use of the building.
15.46	The provision of travel appears at odds with the stated aim of the proposal.	All issues raised by Estyn were addressed in the Consultation Report in respect of this proposal. The authority has acknowledged that implementation of the proposal would lead to additional travel for those pupils for whom Nantmel C. in W. School is currently their closest school, however the authority's view is that the additional travel required would not be excessive.
15.47	Powys CC has not considered well enough the impact on nursery education.	<p>All issues raised by Estyn were addressed in the Consultation Report in respect of this proposal. The proposal for the closure of the school will include children of Nursery age as well of those in the older age groups of Reception to Year 6. If the school were to close the Nursery age children would transfer to the named receiving school or the school of the parents' choice in line with the procedures that will be followed for the older children.</p> <p>Those children of Nursery age who will reach Nursery age in the 2016-17 school year and who have/ expect to be offered a place in Nantmel will be offered places in the named receiving school or the school of the parents' choice (subject tp place availability).</p> <p>The authority has undertaken a separate consultation around the change of age of admission into Primary Schools, with the cabinet approving the change at a meeting</p>

		<p>in late spring.</p> <p>The change to commencing school to the start of the child's reception year will be supported by an increase and length of the funded 3 plus provision. A separate project has commenced around the management of change and commissioning of this extended service for the start of the 2017-18 school year. The project will ensure that funded places are available for all children whose parents wish to take up the provision.</p>
15.48	The current proposal does not create any surplus places and does not improve education standards at all for the pupils.	The authority agrees that the current proposal does not create any surplus places, and that in fact, the proposal would lead to a reduction in surplus places in the local area. Whilst the quality of education at Nantmel C. in W. School is not one of the reasons why the authority is proposing closure of the school, the authority is satisfied that education of an equivalent standard would be provided at the named receiving school.
15.49	The well-being of the pupils has never got a mention at all yet it is their well-being that is paramount.	<p>The authority is committed to ensuring the well-being of all pupils, and to ensuring that 'all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential'.</p> <p>The Proposal is aligned with the requirements of the Welsh Government's School Organisation Code, which states that 'Relevant bodies should place the interests of learners above all others. With reference to the key questions of the Office of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales (Estyn), they should give paramount importance to the likely impact of the proposals on the quality of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • outcomes (standards and wellbeing); • provision (learning experiences, teaching, care, support and guidance, and learning environment); and • leadership and management (leadership, improving quality, partnership working and resource management)'. <p>A number of issues related to the proposal's impact on pupil well-being were raised during the consultation period. These issues were responded to in the consultation report and were taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to this proposal.</p>

		The authority accepts that any school reorganisation proposal creates a period of uncertainty for pupils, however should Nantmel C. in W. School close, the receiving school or any other school pupils might wish to transfer to would provide support to pupils to aid their transition, to ensure their well-being.
15.50	There is certainly nothing transformational about the proposal to close the school.	The authority has not claimed that this proposal is 'transformational'. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.' The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
15.51	The Gypsy/Traveller Community pupils who frequently attend the school would be impacted by closure.	A possible impact on pupils from the Gypsy/Traveller community was identified by the authority in the Equality Impact Assessment in respect of this proposal. However, there is no evidence that any pupils from the Gypsy/Traveller community currently attend the school.
15.52	When considering the impact of the proposals on pupils outcomes and provision, Powys CC does not consider sufficient evidence.	Consideration was given to the proposal's impact on outcomes and provision on page 9 of the consultation document.
15.53	The response to this Consultation has been massive. You have received 127 written representations, a petition signed by 849 people and you have received almost 800 questions and queries.	<p>It is true that 127 written representations were received to the consultation, and a significant number of issues were raised. These issues are listed in the consultation report, along with the authority's response to them.</p> <p>A petition was received in December, prior to the Cabinet's decision to commence consultation on closure of Nantmel C. in W. School. The petition was taken into consideration by Cabinet when making this decision.</p>
15.54	A great number of the representations have not been properly answered and those who have raised all these issues need to have their concerns addressed before a decision can be made on the future of the school.	The Consultation Report in respect of this proposal lists the issues raised during the consultation period along with the response to these issues.

15.55	We live in a democracy and these figures cannot be ignored.	<p>The authority notes this comment. A large number of issues were raised during the consultation period in respect of this proposal, and these issues were taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed.</p> <p>However, pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are low and are not expected to increase in the coming years. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.' The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.</p>
15.56	There is total opposition to the proposed closure of Nantmel School, one of the best primary schools in Powys with a history of providing first class education for the past 160 years.	<p>The authority notes this comment. A large number of issues were raised during the consultation period in respect of this proposal, and these issues were taken into consideration by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed.</p> <p>However, pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are low and are not expected to increase in the coming years. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.' The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.</p>
15.57	<p>I would like to quote a paragraph I read recently which I believe is relevant to Nantmel School's situation:-</p> <p>"Instead of looking at pupil unit costs in isolation Councils should evaluate the benefit of small schools in wider economic and social terms. Children educated in small schools consistently do well academically with good behaviour and positive attitudes to life and learning. They avoid the heavy costs of later educational disaffection and failure while their more enduring school performance enhances their career prospects."</p>	The authority notes this comment.

15.58	Would it not be wonderful for Powys CC for once to listen to the views of so many throughout the consultation process and actually make an effort to deliver what they want. Wouldn't that be a better day's work for us all.	The authority did listen to the views expressed during the consultation process and these were taken into consideration by Cabinet when determining how to proceed. However, pupil numbers at Nantmel C. in W. School are small, and are not expected to increase in the next few years. As stated in the One Powys Plan, 'we need to re-organise schools (primary, secondary and post 16) to ensure affordability, sustainability and appropriate leadership capacity.' The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure.
15.59	To close an award winning, highly successful school on the basis of this report would be negligence. I urge members of the Cabinet not to allow it to happen on their watch.	The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. The authority is committed to ensuring that 'all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential'. The authority's view is that the named receiving school can provide high quality education and can meet the needs of the children currently attending Nantmel C. in W. School.
15.60	In Wales we now have a new Minister for Education in the Assembly, Kirsty Williams. She is already making waves and has stated that a top priority for her is to introduce a Rural Schools Policy for Wales which they already have in England and Scotland.	The authority notes this comment. There is currently no Rural Schools Policy in operation.
15.61	I believe it would be prudent to wait for the new Rural Schools Policy which I understand will be available shortly before making a decision on Nantmel School.	There is currently no Rural Schools Policy in operation. The authority is keen to conclude this process in respect of Nantmel C. in W. School as swiftly as possible in order to minimise this period of uncertainty for all involved.
Objection 16		
16.1	How can you offer places to pupils from Nantmel when the school is already unable to maintain a standard or meet the needs of pupils?	The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. The authority is committed to ensuring that 'all children and young people are supported to achieve their full potential'. The authority's view is that the named receiving school can provide high quality education and can meet the needs of the children currently attending Nantmel C. in W. School.

16.2	Child had been in reception for a year before it was highlighted the serious standard of toilets, with raw sewerage seeping into the walkway to the dining room, and concrete broken under toilets and same sex sharing urinal and toilet in the same room – this was sorted through a fight	The authority has clear procedures for the reporting of building defects and an agreed process to address such defects within the available resources. The authority is not aware of any major issues at either the named receiving school or Crossgates C.P. School that is not already within the authority's planning procedures.
16.3	Concerns me that many hidden issues at the receiving school will be compounded by increasing school numbers	The authority has a duty to ensure that there is an available place for all pupils at the named receiving school. Rhayader C. in W. School has a current level of surplus places which can accommodate the pupils from Nantmel.
16.4	Nantmel School has a thriving rich warm community that you would never understand unless you were part of it	The authority notes this comment. A range of issues in relation to the proposal's impact on the community were raised during the consultation period and were taken into consideration by Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to this proposal, however the aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, economic and social factors are non-educational issues.
16.5	Being educated in this school was my foundation to working in some extreme conditions across Europe	The authority notes this comment. There is no reason to believe that pupils would not continue to be successful should they attend a different school.
16.6	By closing down these very special local schools you are taking the heart out of Wales and losing the identity of our children from these rural communities	The authority notes this comment. A range of issues in relation to the proposal's impact on the community were raised during the consultation period and were taken into consideration by Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to this proposal, however the aim of this Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, economic and social factors are non-educational issues.
16.7	Should look at making Nantmel a Welsh language school as Rhayader is brimming	The authority notes this comment. There are currently no plans to establish a Welsh-medium school to serve the children currently attending the Welsh-medium stream at Rhayader C. in W. School.

16.8	Negativity from the council has led to a decline in numbers as it creates too much uncertainty for parents who also have to travel to work	As stated in the consultation document, there were 36 pupils at Nantmel C. in W. School in January 2011, and pupil numbers have decreased since then. The pupil projections for Nantmel C. in W. School that were considered before this process started did not suggest any significant increase in pupil numbers. The authority notes that any school reorganisation process will lead to a period of uncertainty for those affected, however no formal consultation has previously taken place in respect of closure of Nantmel C. in W. School.
16.9	With the recent referendum can the consultation also be presented to Theresa May, or invite her to the school	Education in Wales is a devolved matter, and is the responsibility of the Welsh Government, therefore it would not be appropriate to invite Theresa May to the school. Information about the proposal has been sent to the Welsh Government and local Assembly Members in line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code, and they will continue to be advised of further developments relating to the proposal.
Objection 17		
17.1	Concerned that the Council is still considering closing the school	The authority notes this concern.
17.2	The Playgroup ensures that local parents don't become isolated	The authority notes this comment. The aim of the Proposal is to ensure the long-term sustainability of a high quality education infrastructure. Ultimately, economic and social factors are non-educational issues. A number of issues relating to the impact of closing the school on the community were raised during the consultation period and were taken into consideration by Cabinet when determining how to proceed. All issues raised in the Objections will be taken into consideration by Cabinet when making a final decision on this proposal.
17.3	In your consultation report you say that the named receiving school and other schools in the area have early years provision and you feel that due to the small distance from Nantmel to Rhayader this would only impact	The authority notes this comment. This was taken into consideration by the Council's Cabinet when determining how to proceed in relation to this proposal.

	parents of young children who do not have available transport to travel to the named receiving school and other schools – these are the very parents you should be helping	
17.4	If the school closed we would not have any other suitable accommodation in the village to host a similar group	The authority has acknowledged that a range of community activities take place in the school as this is the only suitable accommodation in the village. As stated in the Consultation Document, ‘The land and buildings currently occupied by Nantmel C. in W. School are owned by the Church in Wales, and the playing field is leased by the County Council. If the school were to close, the building would remain in the ownership of the Church in Wales, and the lease in respect of the playing field would be surrendered.’ Should the school close, it would be a matter for the Church in Wales to determine what to do with the building.
17.5	The named receiving school is not really suitable for small preschool children due to the huge quantity of steps	The authority does not agree with this comment. In January 2014, Estyn stated that ‘the school building meets the needs of pupils and staff well.’ The school is a former Secondary Modern school, however it has been adapted to deliver primary education to primary pupils of all ages, and has done so successfully for many years.
17.6	Steps create hazards and have a lot more risks for small children which the authority has noted in the report	The authority notes this comment. In January 2014, Estyn stated that ‘the school building meets the needs of pupils and staff well.’ The school is a former Secondary Modern school, however it has been adapted to deliver primary education to primary pupils of all ages, and has done so successfully for many years.
17.7	The car park at Rhayader, access to it and the state of the building in general are issues of concern	<p>The authority acknowledges that the number of car parking places at the school is lower than the number that would be provided for a new school however the number of places are in line with the number of places at similar sized older schools. The majority of children in Nantmel would be transported to the school, therefore the additional transport on a daily basis would be minimal. There is also a large car park within close proximity of the school which could be used by parents.</p> <p>The authority recognises that the access to Rhayader C. in W. school is not of the highest quality but the entrance has been assessed on a number of occasions by a Health and Safety Officer and meets the authority’s requirements, however it will continue to be monitored by both the school and the local authority.</p>

		As stated in the consultation document, the building at Rhayader was given a Condition assessment of B by surveyors appointed by the Welsh Government in 2009.
17.8	We feel that Nantmel C. in W. School is a far more suitable and safer school for our young children.	All Powys primary schools provide a safe, suitable and secure environment for all children.
17.9	The report says that should Nantmel close, the authority would work with and support the school in developing and implementing a traffic management scheme at the start and end of the school day. Can you let me know a timescale as to how and when this would happen?	The Health and Safety Officer supporting the Schools Service has already commenced discussions and provided advice to the school. This will be continued from the start of the autumn term.